

Shifting Identities: A Comparative Study of Basque and Western Cultural Conceptualisations

[...] the word does not forget where it has been and can never wholly free itself from the dominion of the contexts of which it has been part.

M. M. Bakhtin (1973: 167)

Everybody says, 'After you take a bear's coat off, it looks just like a human'. And they act human: they fool, they teach their cubs (who are rowdy and curious), and they remember.

Maria Johns (cited in Snyder, 1990: 164)

Every language is a vast pattern-system, different from others, in which are culturally ordained the forms and categories by which the personality not only communicates, but also analyses nature, notices or neglects types of relationship and phenomena, channels his reasoning, and builds the house of his consciousness.

Benjamin Lee Whorf (1956: 252)

Introduction

Over the past two decades increasing attention has been directed toward analysing the highly dynamic interactive relationship holding between language and culture, specifically the way in which language systems as supra-individual entities, both reflect and constrain processes of identity and selfhood, a field of study that is referred to as 'cultural linguistics' (Palmer, 1996). In the case of language systems that share the same or highly similar cultural conceptualisations, the latter tend not to come into clear focus and are not viewed as inherently ideological. Rather our tacit understanding of these cultural conceptualisations contributes to the implicit conceptual consensus found in a given population of speakers, community or society. At the same time, because of the socially situated nature of discourse, communication takes place from within this horizon of shared, unproblematical convictions, these consensus-generating interpretative patterns (Habermas, 1994: 66). Yet, the same situatedness that regularly constrains one's own 'communicative conceptual horizon', as Bakhtin (1981: 269-295) has called this aspect of communicative acts, can be disrupted by an encounter with speakers communicating from within a radically different conceptual horizon. And an even more complex notion of situatedness comes into view when a speaker must move back and forth between two environments, two incommensurate cultural paradigms, each with its own set of ontological metaphors (cf. Olds, 1992). This has been the case for bilingual Basque

speakers who must move discursively, back and forth, between two metaphoric systems, thus, continuously readjusting their conceptual horizon to suit the language they are speaking, most particularly the root metaphors that, taken collectively, constitute a type of metaphysical common ground, the 'lifeworld', as Habermas has called it:

Communicative actors are always moving within the horizon of their lifeworld, they cannot step outside of it. (Habermas, 1997, II: 126)

As Schattenmann (forthcoming) has succinctly explained in his study of Habermas:

The lifeworld is the invisible and indispensable background of everything we do and of everything we are (of everything, to be more precise, that is not purely biological).

Thus, the lifeworld can be understood as some sort of non-thematic knowledge that is characterised by an 'unmediated certainty', a 'totalising power' and a 'holistic constitution'; it is composed of cultural patterns, legitimate social orders and personality structures, forming complex contexts of meaning (Schattenmann, forthcoming citing Habermas 1997: 2 ff.; 1982: 594). Moreover, we can think of it "as represented by a culturally transmitted and linguistically organised stock of interpretative patterns" (Habermas 1997, II: 124).¹

In addition:

[t]his stock of knowledge supplies members with unproblematic common background convictions that are assumed to be guaranteed; it is from these that contexts for the processes of reaching understanding get shaped [...]. Every new situation appears in a lifeworld composed of a cultural stock of knowledge that is always already familiar (Habermas 1997, II: 125).

In this way the lifeworld represents the large but limited space within which communication and understanding are possible. It is the background of communicative action (Habermas 1982: 593):

Its status is different from that of other 'world-concepts'. In its immediate certainty, totalising power and holistic nature it is not something we can reach an understanding about – because it is itself the pre-condition of understanding. To be sure, the components of the lifeworld are embodied in some form, they have a material *substrate*: the cultural knowledge in

¹This statement brings to mind Goodenough's (1957: 167) often-cited definition: Culture is 'whatever it is one has to know or believe in order to operate in a manner acceptable to its members'. Here the expression 'communicative competence' could be substituted for 'culture' in Goodenough's definition without significant loss of meaning or applicability.

symbolic forms, in things of daily use, technologies, theories, words, books and documents no less than in actions; the social orders in institutions and all webs of normatively regulated practices and customs; the personality structures in the human body itself (Schattenmann, forthcoming, emphasis in original).

Others have spoken of ‘an inarticulated background metaphysics’ or ‘foundational metaphysics’ (cf. Haila, 2000) that informs this amorphously constituted, yet pervasive, entity referred to by Habermas as the lifeworld. The dominant structuring elements, produced and reproduced by cultural processes, are embedded in an ideological matrix that in turn derives from and lends support to the foundational metaphysics of the culture in question. In the case of the worldview associated with Western and westernised patterns of thought significant attention has been paid, of late, to the presence of certain asymmetric dualisms that serve to structure these interpretive pattern grids. These, in turn, are often elevated to the level of metaphysical postulates. Stated differently, *foundational schemas* organise or link up a set of cultural conceptualisations, creating a network held together by the unarticulated background metaphysics to which the foundational schemas contribute and from which they draw their strength (Sharifian, 2003; also Frank, 2003a, b; Patent, forthcoming; Shore, 1996: 195). Indeed, we could argue that among the foundational schemas of the Western worldview there is one that has been involved in licensing or sanctioning asymmetric dualisms and, therefore, dichotomous thought.

Of particular relevance in this comparative study of Basque and Western worldviews is Sharifian’s discussion of the distributed nature of *cultural conceptualisations*. He points out that cultural conceptualisations are not equally imprinted in the minds of all the members of a cultural/linguistic community. Rather they are represented in a distributed fashion, and more specifically, in a heterogeneously distributed manner. Hence, individual speakers’ awareness of and allegiance to a particular cultural schema will vary (Sharifian, 2003 and forthcoming). These variations in awareness and allegiance depend, at least in part, on the sociocultural situatedness of the individual speaker and the person’s familiarity with the (traditional) cultural norms of the community in question.

With respect to our analysis of these Western asymmetric polarities, we need to emphasise that in Sharifian’s distributed network approach to cultural conceptualisations

elements of a cultural schema may be heterogeneously represented across the minds of a sociocultural community. Consequently, members of a cultural group may share some, but not all, elements of a given cultural schema, e.g. accept some but not all asymmetric polarities of the Western model. And this pattern of knowledge representation indicates that, when off-loaded, the resulting cognitive artifacts, both linguistic and material in nature, can act as ‘memory banks’ for the schema in question. The cultural conceptualisations emerge from interactions between the members of a cultural group and therefore, the members of a cultural group act to negotiate and renegotiate their *emergent cultural cognition* across time and space. (Sharifian, forthcoming). Hence, even though a set of cultural conceptualisations are entrenched in a given worldview and form an integral part of the foundational metaphysics of that culture, they are not frozen in place but rather subject to constant reformulation. Moreover, the discursively produced subjectivities resulting from these collectively held cultural conceptualisations are also subject to modification (cf. Frank, 2001b; 2003a; forthcoming b).² In other words, according to this view language and culture are fused together as a dynamic interactive whole.

1. An example of an entrenched cultural schema: ‘A black sheep in every flock’

In recent years the foundational metaphysics intrinsic to the traditional worldview of *Euskaldunak* (Basque speakers) has become the focus of extensive analysis as well as considerable debate. These investigations have benefited from the use of Euskara (Basque) as a tool for identifying highly entrenched cultural conceptualisations making up the otherwise often unarticulated ideological matrix of the traditional worldview. These cultural conceptualisations – habits of thought – form part of this cognitively backgrounded figure, namely, the common ground of discourse, upon which discussions of Basque identity and subjectivity have been and continue to be carried out. By deliberately focusing on these collectively held cognitive patterns, Basque identity, *euskalduntasuna* – the concept of selfhood and group identity – is constantly brought into focus, debated, negotiated, affirmed and rearticulated.

² For our purposes the terms *cultural conceptualisations* (Sharifian, 2003; forthcoming) and *cultural schemas* will be used interchangeably. For additional commentary on the role of cultural linguistics in identifying cultural schemas, cf. Palmer (1996; 2006).

Yet meanings understood by Euskaldunak frequently go unnoticed or misread by those not fully conversant in the cultural coding of traditional Basque thought. For example, a non-Basque speaking individual who is, therefore, a cultural outsider, upon hearing an affirmation such as ‘Yes, in Euskal Herria there is a black sheep in every flock,’ will attempt to map cultural conceptualisation belonging to what is commonly understood as the Western worldview onto the sentence. In other words, using cultural conceptualisations familiar to most Europeans, the person will interpret this sentence negatively. In contrast a positive interpretation comes into focus when one takes up the perspective afforded by the cultural conceptualisations of the traditional Basque worldview, for, as we shall see, the entailments of the colour *black* have a positive valence.

The difference in interpretation results from the fact that there are two different metaphoric repertoires in operation: two different sets of cultural conceptualisations at work. Yet, at first glance, the reader assumes that they are commensurate with each other. Stated differently, although structures from the set of traditional Basque cultural conceptualisations are operating in the sentence, to someone who has been inculcated by Western cultural schemas, the sentence seems unproblematic: it appears to utilise a commonplace colour-coded element found in the Western cognitive grid.³ This leads to a misreading by the cultural outsider, a reading that will result in a serious misapprehension of the sentence's referentiality. Indeed, the outsider's unfamiliarity with the conceptual apparatus at work will produce the following result: the underlying complexity of meaning embedded in the statement will go totally unnoticed. This effect can be explained by the fact that such an outsider is normally competent only in interpreting cultural conceptualisations belonging to his/her own cultural system; in this case those found in the Western worldview. Thus, s/he works with a different logic of metaphor and analogy. There are different metaphorical construals and entailments; a different

³ Since the death of Franco in 1975, Basque popular culture has been revitalised. As a result, given that traditional Basque cultural conceptualisations form an integral part of the metaphoric coding of popular performance art, this revival has resulted in increased interest on the part of educators and other investigators in exploring the metaphoric repertoire embedded in the overall system. This concern is linked to increased recognition on the part of educators of the need to explore and clarify the cultural schema making up the traditional Basque worldview, and in turn the historically constituted ‘common ground’ of discourse in Basque. The investigative process is not merely an academic one for its implications are clearly relevant for those concerned with preserving and fostering Basque identity.

conceptual framework is functioning, in which only certain things *count* as part of the mapping, and they *count* only in certain systematic ways (Turner, 1991: 175).

These apparently obvious understandings are culturally grounded. In such readings of metaphor, what will be highlighted and attended to cognitively is determined by the degree to which the individual has acquired and internalised the cultural schemas belonging to and produced by the linguistically grounded social praxis of the group in question. The acquisition and internalisation of such metaphoric understandings is one of the measures of an individual's acculturation and ultimate identification with the cognitive norms of his/her socio-linguistic group. It is the acceptance or at least the tacit recognition of these cultural conceptualisations which Basque culture sanctions as legitimate ways of thinking, knowing and perceiving. The shared understandings implicit in these cultural conceptualisations give rise to the discursive coherence that characterises a particular culture, even though as Sharifian (forthcoming) has explained, people operate on the basis of the assumption of shared understandings while, in reality, cultural conceptualisations are heterogeneously distributed across any given culture, albeit forming a complex network where certain nodes with a higher level high of agreement are more easily accessed, e.g. metaphoric construals of colour-coding.

In contrast, we can consider what takes place when two speakers, grounded in systems that are in some fashion incommensurate, come into contact with each other. In this type of communicative situation it is quite possible that the cultural outsider will draw, quite automatically, on his/her interpretive competency: this cognitive process being based on accessing the contextual grid provided to the speaker by the speaker's familiarity with the pertinent cultural conceptualisations and the culturally backgrounded meanings entrenched in them. Since these metaphoric construals are for the most part automatic, non-reflective, and hence, not based on extended discursive commentary, such an individual will not necessarily be aware of his/her misapprehension of what is happening in the communicative situation in question.

Consequently, in reference to the meanings coded into our sample affirmative sentence ('Yes, in Euskal Herria there is a black sheep in every flock'), two readings are possible,

that is, the sentence evokes two different sets of sanctioned construals.⁴ One set is based on the interpretive competency of a reader who has been acculturated by the Western metaphoric repertoire, structures that are themselves grounded in a complex schema, a cultural model known as the Great Chain of Being (Lakoff and Turner, 1989). The latter is a deeply ingrained set of hierarchically organised concepts: pairs of polarised, mutually exclusive oppositions whose geometry is characterised by a strong vertical axis. When discussing the dichotomous metaphysics of the West, i.e. its recourse to asymmetric dualism, most descriptions of the resulting cultural schemas highlight only a few of the minimal conceptual pairs composing it, particularly the pair representing the opposed notions of high and low.⁵ As a result little attention is paid to the arbitrary nature of the model's colour-coding which assigns a positive, higher value to white and a negative, lower value to black. Thus, a speaker of English has no difficulty working out the equivalencies: 'high is white' and 'low is black' (cf. Hawkins, 2000). In our description of this aspect of the Western cultural schemas we shall utilise colour-coding in a particular fashion, taxonomically, i.e. to classify the conceptual pairings and resulting ontological metaphors.

Although to think metaphorically is automatic and conventional, it appears that certain metaphoric understandings cluster together, forming sets of interlocking and mutually

⁴ In Euskal Herria the situation is further complicated by the fact that until quite recently most Basque speakers' formal schooling has been based on texts informed by standard Western thought processes. These cultural conceptualisations were presented to students as a prestige model of upward mobility: their schooling was conducted exclusively in Spanish or French. That resulted in a partial assimilation of the Western cultural schemas and/or at least in the ability on the part of native Basque speakers to recognise that they had to switch metaphoric codes when speaking to someone acculturated in the westernised model. Previously native speakers of Basque were exposed to the Western worldview primarily at school while their home environment continued to reflect the Basque worldview. In contrast, today it is not uncommon for fluency in Euskara to be acquired not through direct transmission of the language from parent to child, but rather through institutional settings and classroom exposure. That type of transmission has sometimes resulted in an incomplete assimilation of the subtler aspects of certain Basque cultural conceptualisations. On the other hand, educators are often concerned with finding ways to explore and foster traditional cultural conceptualisations.

⁵ For instance, Lakoff and Johnson (1980: 22-24) have suggested that the values associated with the up-down spatialisation metaphors and their opposites are deeply embedded in our culture. They are speaking of equivalencies such as 'more is up', 'good is up' and 'high status is up'. These they link to notions such as 'more is better', and 'bigger is better'. In contrast, the Basque worldview has no vertical axis and seems to be grounded on notions not of quantity, but quality, namely, on being able to match the task to the entity endowed with the capacity suitable for carrying it out. This concept is expressed by the notion of *gaitasuna*, based on the root-stem *gai* 'capacity, innate potential of being'. While Western cultural conceptualisations seem to be based on notions of quantity and excess, the Basque cultural conceptualisations repeatedly

reinforcing conceptual frames. For instance, in recent years it has become increasingly apparent that in Euskal Herria that there are different notions of subjectivity and, in certain respects, we could say that identities are in conflict. At the centre of this ideological debate is the question of the degree to which an individual accepts and/or internalises a given interpretative grid, one provided by the *root metaphors* of his/her culture (Bowers, 1993). It is the latter that determines his/her sense of identity, providing what Morgan (1997; 1998) has called ‘frames of self-presentation’ and consequently the cognitively backgrounded field of conceptual categories and related strategies upon which representations of ideology are played out, often quite unconsciously. For this reason the present study forms part of this overall process of increasing self-reflection that in the past decade has come to characterise Basque cognitive anthropology and cultural linguistics (Azurmendi, 1991; Fernández de Larrinoa, 1997; Gaiak Argitaldaria, 1995; Galfarsoro, 1998; 2000; Gil Bera, 1990; Hartsuaga, 1987; Perurena, 1992; 1993; Cameron Watson, 1996).

Indeed, the comparative work referred to in this paper is drawn from the results of a similar investigative project dedicated to the recuperation of ethno-mathematical and ethno-astronomical traditions embedded in what appears to be an earlier pan-European eco-centric cosmology (Frank, 1999a; 1999b; Frank and Arregi Bengoa, 2001; Frank and Patrick, 1993; Zaldua, 1996; 2006). The research carried out to date suggests that the latter cosmology was eventually overshadowed by the (modern) Western one, even though the former has continued to survive in the metaphoric coding of certain European folk performances encountered outside Euskal Herria. This statement refers to the widespread presence of remnants of an alternative metaphoric mode of thought, not only in Euskal Herria, but also in other parts of Europe (Frank, 1996; 1997; forthcoming a; Urbeltz, 1994). For this reason even for someone familiar only with European modes of cultural conceptualisation, when confronted with the Basque data, s/he will find that certain elements in it sound strangely familiar and resonate oddly with those found in the European dataset.

emphasise quality and proportionality. Nonetheless, Western modes of thought have made inroads, blurring and/or erasing some of the indigenous patterns of cognition.

In short, the present study forms part of a larger project focused on recuperating the metaphysics associated with this earlier pan-European eco-centric worldview and its rich repertoire of ontological metaphors. In that process, of particular interest to us has been the analysis of the cultural conceptualisations functioning in a set of contemporary ritual folk performances found across much of Europe, most particularly those involving human actors dressed as bears who function as healers, bringers of good health. Collectively, these popular performance pieces constitute a genre known as ‘good-luck visits’ (Frank, 2001a; forthcoming a). At this stage the results of our investigation suggest that the Basque worldview, externalised in the colour-coding of these performances and related ritual and linguistic artifacts, should not be understood as an isolated survival, but rather as perhaps the best preserved exemplar of the metaphysical foundations embedded in this earlier European cosmology. Furthermore, these metaphoric understandings manifest themselves in a variety of ways. Indeed, the Basque language, Euskara, provides us with a mechanism for recuperating the modes of thought intrinsic to the earlier cosmology. As we shall demonstrate, the lexicon of Euskara is often rightly identified as a rich repository of such cultural knowledge (Perurena, 1992).⁶

In this respect we should recall Bakhtin’s valuable commentary on the ‘inner life of the word’ (*slovo*), which is equally applicable to *root metaphors* for each word, just as each metaphor:

tastes of the context and contexts in which it has lived its socially charged life: all words and forms are populated by intentions. Contextual overtones [...] are inevitable in the word (Bakhtin, 1981: 293).

Furthermore, the word, just as a metaphor:

is not a thing, but rather the eternally mobile, eternally changing medium of dialogical intercourse. It never coincides with a single consciousness or a single voice. The life of the word is in its transferral from one mouth to another, one

⁶ In speaking of recuperating this earlier pan-European cosmology utilising the Basque datasets, it should be kept in mind that metaphoric understandings are not, strictly speaking, ‘language-bound’ in the same sense that a syntactic system is. Stated differently, metaphoric schemas tend to be culturally produced and reproduced and this bond is also manifested linguistically in backgrounded figures of discourse and the connotations of the terms and concepts found in the lexicon. For transmission of the system to take place there is no need for the syntax (grammar) of the receiving language to be similar to that of the donor language, e.g. the languages of Christian missionaries and those they seek to convert. In short, it is clear that over centuries the cultural conceptualisations intrinsic to the Western worldview have penetrated a wide variety of linguistic systems around the world without any need for the syntactic systems of the languages in question to be genetically or typologically related.

social collective to another, and one generation to another. In the process the word does not forget where it has been and can never wholly free itself from the dominion of the contexts of which it has been a part. (Bakhtin, 1973: 167)

Therefore to paraphrase Bakhtin, when each member of a collective of speakers takes possession of a word or metaphor, it is not neutral, free from the aspirations and valuations of others, uninhabited by foreign voices. Rather the speaker receives it from the voice of another, and the word/metaphor is filled with that voice. The word arrives in its context from another context that is saturated with other people's interpretations. The speaker's:

own thought finds the word already inhabited. Therefore the orientation of the word among words, the various perceptions of the other person's word and the various means of reacting to it are, perhaps, the most essential problems of the metalinguistic study of every kind of word [...] (Bakhtin, 1973: 167).

As Danow has pointed out, in a broader sense the term *heteroglossia*, used by Bakhtin to refer to the fundamentally dialogic nature of the utterance, brings into focus:

the multiple connotations a word bears by virtue of its association with some ideological position, social or political group, or single individual. The notion of heteroglossia, in effect, represents the positive correlative to the idea that no word is neutral, and that 'no word belongs to no one'; for the converse asserts that every word belongs to someone, who, having used it in a certain context, has imbued it with a special sense peculiar to that context. In time, the word becomes identified with all such contextual 'residue' (Danow, 1984: 83).

In this sense, the positive valence of the colour-coding still associated with 'black' in Basque is an example of the way the actions of individual speakers, taken collectively, function: individual speakers have been able to transmit their voices across time.

In order to further illustrate the manner in which the ontological metaphors belonging to the Western and Basque models are incommensurate, yet oddly linked, the associated cultural schemas in question will be brought forward for consideration. The remainder of this study consists of three parts. The first section looks at the metaphoric repertoire provided by the paired sets of metaphors in each model, the Western model and the Basque one, focusing our attention primarily on the colour-coding intrinsic to the Basque version. The following section examines some theoretical considerations related to the role of cognitive linguistics in such an investigation. Then in the final section we analyse

several exemplary texts in order to demonstrate how the two contrasting datasets manifest themselves in speech acts.

2. The Two Models

As is well known, the Western worldview brings into play an extended colour-coded cultural model known as the Great Chain of Being, grounded in a mutually exclusive, asymmetric opposition between 'black' and 'white'. In contrast, the Basque model introduces complementary colour-coded oppositions consisting of 'black' and 'red'. The Basque dataset model should not be understood as merely some kind of inversion of the Western one, but rather as being composed of a radically different set of cognitive alignments. Nonetheless, there are junctures where the reader may be able to identify a certain overlap between the component parts of the two systems. Moreover, in the case of the Basque model it is clear that these alignments hark back to earlier indigenous pan-European beliefs in the efficacy of the colour black, its intrinsic epistemological grounding in notions of fecundity and wholeness as well as the positive role of black animals in general.

So far our provisional research results argue for the following scenario: that in the case of Europe the powerful life-giving and protecting characteristics associated previously with the colour black have been distorted, although not totally eradicated from the consciousness of Europeans, in part because of the influence of the Catholic Church and the Inquisitional authorities. The task of countering black's positive polarity was central to the Church's efforts to win converts. Given that the colour black was a key component in the competing eco-centric cosmology, attempts to assign a different value to it constituted an assault on one of the principle tenets of the indigenous interpretative grid. The fact that the colour black continues to have a highly charged aura about it – the sudden appearance of a black cat still generates a certain level of uneasiness in modern urban dwellers – testifies to the resilient nature of the older eco-centric cosmology: it has not been forgotten.

In contrast to the hierarchical anthropocentric cultural model encountered in and propagated by the ontological metaphors encountered in the Western dataset, we allege that those found in the Basque dataset derive their vitality from this earlier pan-European

eco-centric cosmology, grounded in a different myth of origins, namely, in the belief that humans descend from bears. Reflexes of belief in the sacredness of bears are still encountered in the rich folkloric traditions and practices of Euskal Herria.⁷ At the same time they are exteriorised year after year in a variety of similar folk performances in the Pyrenees and other parts of Europe (Frank, 2001b; forthcoming a; Hollingsworth, 1891; Lebeuf, 1987; Molina González and Vélez Pérez, 1986; Praneuf, 1989; Vukanović, 1959). Moreover we have the stories told about *Hartz-Kume* ('Little Bear'), the half-bear half-human protagonist who plays the role of a shaman apprentice. Indeed, the tales represent the most widespread motif in European folklore (Cosquin, 1887: 1-27). In other parts of Europe the main character goes by the name of the Bear Son (Fabre, 1968; 1986; Frank, forthcoming a; Peillen, 1982).⁸ In the archetypal tales the shaman apprentice is accompanied by Spirit Animal Guardians who also play a major role. Such helper animals are a common element in Native-American traditions as is the vision quest by means of which the ursine archetypal hero/ine acquires his/her shape-shifting skills.⁹ In traditional cultures where humans celebrate their animal ancestry they often trace their genealogy back to bears. Thus, it is not unusual to encounter the belief that animals are humans in disguise or vice versa (Rockwell, 1991). The belief in such shape-shifting abilities on the part of humans and animals is a characteristic of cultures where trophic metaphysics and relational epistemologies underpin the intentional worlds of story-tellers and their audiences (cf. Bird-David, 1999; Brightman, 2002a; 2002b; Hamayon, 1999; Ingold, 2004). Nor is it uncommon for ritual dance and song to involve therio-anthropic figures, half-human, half-animal masked actors representing the eco-centric union of being.

⁷ Today informants avoid using the present tense of the verb in their statements arguing rather that Basques *used to believe* they descended from bears and were, hence, *hartzak eginak* 'made/conceived by the bear' (Peillen, 1986: 171-173; Frank, 1996). Cf. Glosecki (1989: 1-51) for other European 'reflexes' of similar traditions where animals appear disguised as humans (and vice versa).

⁸ The pan-European Bear-Son hero also goes by the name of *Juan el Osito* in Spanish, *Jean l'Ours* in French, *Giovanni l'Orso* in Italian and *Hans Bär* in German; and *Ivan Tsarevich* or *Ivanushko* in Russian.

⁹ For a more detailed discussion of Spirit Animal Guardians, the vision quest and medicine bundle acquired by Hartz-Kume from them in the tales, cf. Frank (1996; 1997; forthcoming a); Frank and Arregi (2001). It should be noted that similar elements, also related to ritual initiation, appear in other European variants of the Bear-Son tales. However, some of the best-delineated versions of the vision quest itself are those encountered in tales collected in Euskal Herria and the adjacent zones where Euskara was spoken previously.

Finally, shape-shifting is thought to be an important part of the repertoire of techniques used by shamanic healers in public performances.

Throughout much of Europe we find a rich legacy of popular performance art linked to these beliefs in our ursine ancestors. Of particular significance is the genre of popular theatre known as ‘good-luck visits’ involving a dancing bear or an actor dressed as a bear along with a retinue of masked figures, dancers and musicians.¹⁰ These ‘visits’ give rise to elaborate performances in many small villages and towns during the winter and spring carnival periods as well as in the festivity of Corpus Christi (Frank, 2001b; forthcoming, a). Furthermore, the colour-coding utilised in these performances gives testimony to the vitality of the older interpretative traditions and ritual practices. For instance, only a spectator familiar with the metaphoric repertoire of the Basque cultural conceptualisations would be fully capable of understanding the meanings conveyed by the colour-coding of the two sets of actors, the *Beltzak* (Blacks) and the *Gorriak* (Reds), found in Basque performances such as the *Pastoralak* and *Maskaradak* (Alaiza, 1978; Caro Baroja, 1965: 181-182; Frank, 2001b; forthcoming a; Hérelle, 1914-17).

Yet variants of the same popular genre of ‘good-luck visits’ are encountered from England to Bulgaria. Their widespread distribution suggests the following scenario. First, the performance pieces themselves with their musicians, guisers, dancing bears and assorted therio-anthropic figures hark back to this earlier relational cosmology founded on ursine descent. Moreover, there is strong evidence that the prophylactic attributes of the bear as well as those of other animal ancestors were celebrated in such plays. Second, we find remarkable structural similarities holding between the Basque and European performances in terms of the nature of the cast of characters, the plot as well as the colour-coding of two opposed, yet complementary, sets of actors who take part in them (Alford, 1928; 1931; 1937; Frank, 2001b; forthcoming a). Given that we are speaking of folk performances carried out without scripts and therefore based on oral tradition, it

¹⁰ In some cases the identity of the masked figures is recognisable, e.g. in the Basque performances. They are the counterparts of the Spirit Guardian Animals that appear in the tales themselves (Alford, 1978; Frank, forthcoming a). The presence of the animal characters is not surprising given that this eco-centric cosmology appears to have been projected skyward onto a set of non-zodiacal constellations. At this point in the research there is reason to believe that standing behind the Hartz-Kume stories are astrally coded traditions grounded in the older pre-Hellenic European myth of ursine origins. The stellar counterparts of the main character Little Bear and his father Great Bear appear to be Ursa Minor and Ursa Major. It should

becomes highly likely that they should be classed as exteriorisations of earlier cultural schemas and are, therefore, representative of the interpretative habits and metaphoric understandings found in the Basque datasets. In short, the genre of ‘good-luck visits’ is further evidence for the resilience of the Basque cultural conceptualisations as well as their residual presence in many parts of Europe, especially among the members of the popular classes.

2.1 Contrasting Basque and Western colour-coded datasets

At this point we can turn our attention to the interlocking ontological metaphors making up the Western dataset, summarised in Table 1. The colour-coded polarities of black and white appear as antithetical, oppositional and hierarchical: those linked to white are conceptualised as ‘positive’ and ‘higher’ than those of black.

Table 1. Expanded set of interlocking colour-coded metaphors (based on the lexicon of English)

Black	White
low	high
bad	good
moon	sun
night	day
darkness	light
body	mind
instinct	reason
crooked	straight
woman	man
wild (nature)	civilised (culture)
beast (animals)	human beings

In short, these polarities are asymmetric. Furthermore, as Howell (1996: 127) has commented in his discussion of the deeply embedded schema of Western culture:

[t]he properties of these dualities have not been held to be of equal value: humans are superior to animals, mind is superior to body, just as thinking is to feeling [...]. Furthermore, the mind and mental processes have been recharged as characteristically male qualities and bodily and emotional concerns as female ones (cf. also Merchant, 1980; Schliebinger, 1993).

be kept in mind that the non-zodiacal constellations in question antedate Greek mythological traditions with their relatively anthropocentric worldview (Frank and Arregi Bengoa, 2001; Gingerich, 1984).

In other words:

[w]hen we further consider a dominant strand of thinking which holds that mind is cultural and body is natural, we find ourselves within the familiar western schema. Such a view is, of course, to be regarded as just one ethnographic example of how humans may construct meaning about their own identities and environments. It is, however, an approach which has universalistic ambitions and it has proved peculiarly resistant to challenges (Howell, 1996: 127).

Cienki (1999: 190) has commented on similar bipolar oppositions, saying that they are:

reminiscent of what Ivanov and Toporov [Ivanov and Toporov, 1965] call 'semiotic modelling systems', pairs of oppositions which often co-align in a coherent way within a culture, and what van Leeuwen-Turnovcová (1991; 1994, and elsewhere) discusses as 'cultural paradigms'.

Although the dichotomous character of the Western epistemology has been discussed at length, particularly the mind/body dualism, less attention has been paid to the mutually reinforcing nature of these dualisms: the way in which they can be viewed as forming 'semiotic modelling systems' and hence 'cultural paradigms'. Furthermore, when speaking of a Western worldview that in turn includes the dominant notions of epistemology, ontology and personhood, it should be emphasised that there are a variety of cultures in the so-called West and, consequently, for our purposes the dualisms discussed are based on the lexicon of English, along with the Anglo-American cultural entailments connected to them.

In Table 2 other ethnographic aspects of the traditional Basque cultural conceptualisations are displayed. These will serve to clarify some of the linkages between the eco-centric ursine genealogy and the cognitive resistance offered by the colour black. In Table 3 the metaphoric understandings of the traditional Basque cultural schemas are coded taxonomically by means of the colours black and red. These, rather than being antithetical and hierarchical, are complementary. Although at first glance it might not seem so, they are heterarchical equals, representing two oscillating poles of being and

reality (Frank, 2001b). Furthermore, in the expanded set there is no indication of a vertical axis.¹¹

Table 2. Basque colour terms (compared to English)

a) Colour-range covered by the Basque terms <i>beltza</i> ‘black’ and <i>gorria</i> ‘red’	
<i>beltza</i>	black>purple>violet>dark blue-red, e.g. red wine is <i>beltza</i> in Euskara
<i>gorria</i>	red>orange>yellowish, e.g. an egg yolk is <i>gorringo</i> in Euskara
b) Basic qualities associated with <i>beltza</i> ‘black’	
black animals are:	life giving and hence bring good luck, purveyors of good health and act as healer-guardians
Thus, to insure the health of each individual group of domestic animals, the recommendation was to have:	
	one black sheep per flock one black rabbit per hutch one black chicken etc.
c) Other qualities associated with the term <i>beltza</i> ‘black’	
Moreover, there are two animals of special note:	
1) the <i>bear</i> = the <i>psychopomp</i> ancestor and keeper of souls, the guardian-healer of all beings.	
Thus, to ensure the health and well-being of all beings and guarantee the order of the cosmos, world renewal ceremonies involving the bear ancestor and other guardian animals were (are) carried out on a regular basis. These are the ‘good-luck visits’.	
2) the <i>black he-goat</i> = keeper and guardian-healer of all domestic animals.	

¹¹ Those unfamiliar with relational epistemologies and belief systems often automatically map the hierarchical geometry of the Judeo-Christian three-tiered model along with its strong upward thrusting, transcendent element onto the multi-levelled cosmologies found among traditional peoples such as the one that appears in the Hartz-Kume tales. Although it would be tempting to see in the spatial co-ordinates of the European tales a seeking of transcendence, as Brunton in his study of Kootenai shamanism has pointed out, all three ‘worlds’ are altered time-sync extensions of this one:

The visionary has not transcended one world to another; he or she has shifted consciousness so as to notice the approach of a spirit who has come to meet him or her. In Harner's (1980) terms, the person has left the ‘ordinary state of consciousness’ (the OSC) and has entered the ‘shamanic state of consciousness’ (the SSC). [...] Ceremonies involve the same basic approach. In each the spirits are ‘called’ to join the Kootenai in the Middleworld to help resolve some problem or provide some information [...]. When Kootenai shamans do ‘journey’, they do so in the Middleworld in a clairvoyant journey (Brunton, 1993: 142-143).

Hence, the Upperworld, as such, is merely the space where birds fly, while the Underworld is where roots grow and rabbits hide.

Table 3. Expanded set of Basque interlocking colour-coded metaphors

<i>beltsa</i> 'black'	<i>gorria</i> 'red'
parodic/burlesque	serious/single-minded
spontaneous	mechanical
humble	prideful
good health	illness
wholeness, plenitude	lack, misery, pain
fecundity	barrenness
playful, mischievous	irascible
flexible, adaptable	inflexible, rigid
disruptive of (excessive) order	orderly
egalitarian	authoritarian
dialogic	monologic

In light of the brief overview provided here, we can see that the European cultural grid produces an interpretation of our sample sentence that projects the black sheep as a dangerous element: it exemplifies the 'trouble-maker', the 'outsider', the 'non-conformist', the one who refuses to go along with the rest and in the process causes dissension. In contrast, the Basque interpretative grid projects a different cultural metaphor of the black sheep: as a positive and necessary element, as the Spirit Animal Guardian, guarantor of fertility and health of the group. Yet, there are deeper implications to the data. For most Europeans today black is not merely a negative colour, it is a dangerous one. Indeed, previously black animals were sacrificed, not because they were evil, but because they were perceived as life-giving and protecting: they were 'good-luck' animals (Alford, 1930; Barandiaran, 1974 VI: 68-71; Creighton, 1950: 21-22). Similarly, the black he-goat, so maligned by the Inquisitional authorities, was not the incarnation of the Christian Prince of Darkness. Rather he was simply the guardian of domestic animals when contemplated from the point of view of the indigenous Basque cultural conceptualisations. In Basque oral tradition, the male goat, particularly a black male goat, the *Aker Beltz* (*aker* 'he-goat' and *beltz* 'black') represents a positive life-protecting principle.¹² Because of the great curative powers attributed to it traditionally, the animal

¹² We should mention that from the expression *Aker Larre* 'He-Goat Field', a reference to sites where traditional festivals were often held, comes the Spanish term *aquelarre* which the Western cognitive framework has seen fit to translate as 'witches' Sabbath'. Festivals are still held at some of the traditional

has been perceived as exercising a beneficent influence upon animals entrusted to its protection and care. Since each individual black he-goat has been considered the concrete representation of the *Aker Beltz* guardian-healer, in many farmsteads, even into the 1950s, this animal was still being kept to ward off death and disease and to guarantee the fertility of farm animals.¹³

Although at times the *Aker Beltz* might be perceived as the most important protector of domestic animals, other black animals share his curative powers. For instance, the black she-goat and ass are found associated with this same complex of thought. As has been mentioned, it is considered wise to keep a black sheep in the flock, a black rabbit among the rabbits, and a black chicken among the chickens. Black animals are also perceived to be more fertile than others.¹⁴ Thus, just as a black he-goat is seen as a life-giving force, according to the norms of the traditional Basque belief system, the positive powers incarnate in black animals in general correspond inversely to the negative powers traditionally associated with them in modern European thought.¹⁵ In fact, the pan-European belief that black animals are dangerous and can bring bad luck may well have its ultimate origin in this older matrix of pre-Christian thought. Clearly the earlier

sites, the most famous being those of the village of Zugarramurdi. The events organised include various acts of commemoration for those villagers who died at the hands of the Inquisitors. For those interested in this topic, there are websites describing the history of the zone and advertising its annual festivities. For information on one of the victims, Maria de Ximildegui of Zugarramurdi, cf. Gifford (1979). And for further information on the traditional role of the woman in Basque religious and ritual life as well as her confrontations with the Inquisitional authorities, cf. Frank (1977; 2001a).

¹³ Barandiaran (1974, II, 375) tells of his neighbour of Bide-garai-Etxeberria in Sara, who, after having bad luck with his flock, bought a he-goat and raised it for a few years. The man assured Barandiaran that once the animal was introduced into his stable, none of his flock died. According to reports transmitted to Barandiaran by Dr. Lavigerie (July 29, 1948), in Cambo goats were still kept to ward off disease in the flock. On the other hand, the antiquity of the belief in the beneficial characteristics of *Aker Beltz* is highlighted by the pre-Christian inscription *AHERBELSTE* recorded and discussed by Sacaze (1982: 432).

¹⁴ For further discussion of the potency of black animals, cf. Barandiaran (1974, VI, 68-71). Azkue (1969: 259) records the following widespread Basque folk belief: 'Black cows give birth to more calves than do those of any other colour' (*Bestalde behi beltzak hume-egileago dira beste koloretakoak baino*), citing *Dialogues Basques* (1857: 95-97). As would be expected, evidence for these older associative patterns can be found in other parts of Europe. For instance, commenting on the key role played by the wild mountain he-goat in the annual Puck Fair of Killorglin, County Kerry, Ireland, Bracken (personal communication) explains that:

there is a tradition among small farmers in the west of Ireland that to have a goat on the farm with the other animals is 'lucky'. In my young days in Kerry I often heard it said that a white calf or cow was 'unlucky' and more prone to disease [...].

¹⁵ Cf. Corradi-Musi (1989: 239-250) and Pócs (1989: 252-250) for similar accounts of the healing powers of animals as well as a more extensive discussion of the socio-economic aspects and identity issues linked to these relational frames of thought in other parts of Europe, especially Eastern Europe.

cosmology portrayed these same animals positively, as endowed with magical, life-giving powers, a belief retained well into the 20th century by the Basque people.¹⁶

Overall, Basque cultural conceptualisations concerned with animals differ radically from those encountered in the standard Western mindset. This results, in part, from the fact that in Basque traditional thought humans trace their ancestry back to bears and, hence, there is no place in their genealogical myth of origins for high anthropomorphic sky gods (Hartsuaga, 1987). In contrast, the hierarchy intrinsic to the expanded Great Chain of Being projects the following scenario. First, we regularly discover a godhead personified as a high anthropomorphic male being, usually portrayed as distant or at least spatially removed from this Earth and its inhabitants. Positioned directly under the godhead is a male human being, sometimes in the form of a king or a high priest, in short, an authority figure. Next in the Natural Order of Things, situated just beneath the human male, we find the human female and finally there on the last rungs of the ladder sit the animals. In fact, some might argue the very last rung is reserved for wild animals, those beasts that for some reason or another have not yet submitted to man's will and hence are still fending for themselves, free in nature.

Therefore, in Euskara the expanded set of shared understandings – the cultural conceptualisations giving coherence to communicative acts – is not commensurate with the polarities found in the set of oppositions making up the Western cultural paradigm. And it is not simply a question of reversing the polarity of the various elements, e.g. substituting black for white or female for male. Rather we must recognise that there are much more fundamental differences at work with profound implications for identity formation. For example, we should recall that the traditional Basque cosmology is grounded in the older pan-European belief that humans descended from bears. That, in itself, is sufficient to throw the Western cultural paradigm into disarray, as Kuhn would say. In short, the belief that we descend from bears ruptures the hierarchical symmetry found in the Western worldview. It radically restructures the co-ordinates in ways

¹⁶ The role played by the *Aker Beltz* and other black animals coincides closely with the notion of 'spirit masters' or 'spirit animal guardians' discussed at length by Hallowell (1960) in his study of Ojibwa ontology, behaviour and worldview as well as in his comments on the more expansive view of 'personhood' that characterises Ojibwa thought, a cultural conceptualisation that goes far beyond our Western understanding of 'self', while it is one that resonates deeply with the Basque ethnographic data and the cultural schemas entrenched in the earlier pan-European cosmology.

perhaps best appreciated by native peoples whose worldviews demonstrate a similar and much more commensurate conceptual eco-centric vision (Hallowell, 1960; McClellan, 1970; Snyder, 1990: 78-90, 155-174; 1995).

Furthermore, in Euskara there is no possibility of setting up an opposition between ‘mind’ and ‘body’ or between ‘reason’ and ‘instinct’. Rather, the term used to refer to ‘mind-like’ events is *gogo*, a word that on its own could be considered a complex schema and consequently a cultural model, especially when juxtaposed to its Western counterpart: the asymmetric dualism of mind/body (cf. Frank, 2003a, b). From the point of view of English the Basque concept might be translated as one whose field of referentiality integrates all of the following notions however, without referring specifically to any one of them separately: mind, desire, pleasure and memory. The extended abstraction *gogoeta* is often glossed as ‘thought’ but it is much more than that. As can be appreciated, *gogo* is an embodied concept that also can be represented, although loosely, by the term *consciousness*. In the latter case where *gogo* is glossed as ‘consciousness’, the bodily-embedded sensorial aspects of *gogo* would need to be underscored. There is simply no term in Euskara that would replicate the Western polarity expressed by the dyadic relationships of mind/body and reason/instinct.¹⁷ In summary, the cultural conceptualisations encountered in the traditional Basque worldview draws their meaning from a radically different geometry, a different, relational epistemological base and ontological configuration of being.¹⁸

¹⁷ In this sense rather than being a dated, even backwards language, totally out of phase with the postmodern mentality of the West, as some non-Basques have argued, Euskara’s lexical inability to replicate the Western notion of ‘mind’ appears to point in a very different direction: to the fact that the Basque notion *gogo* reflects a clear awareness of the embodied nature of all mental activity (cf. Frank, 2003a, b, for a more detailed analysis of this topic). Of late this fact has been increasingly brought to the forefront not only by those working in cognitive linguistics, but also by others working in the neurosciences such as Antonio Damasio:

Taken literally, the statement [*je pense donc je suis/cogito ergo sum* by Descartes] illustrates precisely the opposite of what I believe to be true about the origins of mind and about the relationship between mind and body. It suggests that thinking and awareness of thinking are the real substrates of being. And since we know that Descartes imagined thinking as an activity quite separate from the body, it does celebrate the separation of mind, the ‘thinking thing’ (*res cogitans*), from the non-thinking body, that which has extension and mechanical parts (*res extensa*) (Damasio, 1994: 248).

¹⁸ At this stage in the research it is still too early to draw conclusions about the spatial features of the traditional Basque worldview. So far the evidence point only to indigenous mapping practices based on a cognitively astute system of polar co-ordinates, that is, mathematically speaking, rather than to a system involving an equatorial perspective, more typical of eurocentric cartography and mathematics. For a more

In addition, Basque cultural schemas show no vertical axis, no upward thrust nor seeking movement toward a distant, other-worldly transcendence or disembodied otherness. When one attempts to map a co-ordinate such as the high/low vertical axis typical of the Western dataset onto the co-ordinate system projected by the Basque cultural schemas it becomes readily apparent that a different geometry is operating in the background metaphysics. In fact, we find that in Euskara *goi* ‘high’ is often perceived in temporal terms, as ‘early’, e.g. as in *goiz* (*goi-z*), while *behe* ‘low’ is associated with ‘late’, e.g. *beran(du)* from *behe-ra-n(du)*. Indeed, there is evidence that *goi* ‘high’ as a root-stem is sometimes even manipulated with relatively negative connotations (cf. Frank and Houser, 2004).¹⁹

Finally, it should be emphasised that in the Basque cultural paradigm there is no coding for masculine and feminine, no polar opposition whatsoever that could be construed to correspond to the one found in the Western cultural paradigm.²⁰ And, whereas in recent

detailed examination of these questions as well as the application of the co-ordinate system to celestial navigation, cf. Frank (1999a; 1999b); Frank and Arregi Bengoa (2001).

¹⁹ Luckily, the topological values associated with Basque word for ‘high, above’, namely, *goi*, have not been altered by contact with the vertical axis of the Western cultural schemas where ‘up is good’: the Basque term has a spatial, topological meaning and is not value-laden as is the case in English. In some instances, as noted above, *goi* can take on a temporal meaning as in *goiz* ‘early’. The latter term is a compound, composed of *goi-z* where /z/ represents the instrumental ending. Its temporal application is derived, however, from its original spatial meaning as in expressions such as *goiz-aldera* ‘early, morning’ and *goizalde*, ‘morning’. Literally, these expressions refer to ‘(towards the) going up side’, i.e. the period when the sun is rising in the sky, while a similar topological framework seems to be at work in *beran(du)*, i.e. a reference to the sun’s going down movement.

²⁰ Although it is difficult to assess precisely how the Basque worldview constructed gender, we can assume that cognitive parallels could be identified based on evidence concerning gender construction in other traditional cultures where bear ceremonialism was or is still present. From the evidence, we would argue that the gender identities, if any, conferred by the colour terms are fluid and dynamic in nature, rather than immutable and static. Moreover, we should keep in mind that in bear ceremonialism gender identities are constructed in a radically different fashion (cf. Balzer, 1996; Rockwell, 1992: 10-23; Shepard, 1992; Shepard and Sanders, 1992). Moreover, the attributes of black and red in the Basque dataset do not lend themselves readily to sexual stereotyping nor do they appear to summarise in any particular sense complementary functions of balanced male and female principles. In fact, if one were to attempt such an interpretation, it could lead the reader unwittingly into a conceptual trap: that of essentialising male and female human ‘nature’ using a framework based on a deeply rooted eurocentric dualism. The latter is capable of masking the implications of an indigenous cognitive framework of gender assignment. For example, in a section of his remarkable book *Giving Voice to Bear* where he discusses different aspects of New World bear ceremonialism, Rockwell (1992: 10-23) points out the following pertinent facts. Among the Ojibwa, in order to become ‘bears’, i.e. adults, young women went through a different initiation process than young men who also became ‘bears’. The initiation of young women was indicated by the onset of menstruation. In fact, young women who were about to start their period were called *wemukowe* ‘going to be a bear’. It was this bodily event that triggered the lengthy initiation ceremonies leading to the young woman’s full conversion into an adult and hence into bearhood. When the ceremonies were completed the woman was called *mukowe*, meaning ‘she is a bear’. Quite obviously, when the prototype of human nature

years there have been many exhaustive studies dedicated to remodelling this aspect of the patriarchal foundations inherent to the Western cultural model, few have argued with the appropriateness of the colour-coding which is intimately associated with the same system of antithetical oppositions. In this respect we should mention that the non-commensurability of the two frames also comes into view when we examine other aspects of the colour-coding intrinsic to traditional frames of reference found in Euskara. For example, when comparing the Western dataset to the Basque one we find that in Euskara the term ‘white’ carries a negative charge, not as ‘bad’ or ‘evil’, that is, not as a simple inversion of the Western worldview, but rather as ‘false, untrustworthy, deceitful, lying’, e.g., “I would say to you that ‘white’ is the same thing as saying ‘untrustworthy’ (*‘Zuri’ esango zienat ‘paltso’ esatea bezela baita*’ [Perurena, 1992: 171]). However, we need to remember that the oppositions found in the Basque dataset under discussion are those established between two complementary poles of being communicated metaphorically by colour terms that are not black and white, but rather black and red.

3. Additional Theoretical Considerations

Cognitive linguistics offers us a solid theoretical foundation for recovering the shared understandings belonging to this earlier cosmogony. For instance, Langacker has stated the following:

I would claim, then, that despite its mental focus, cognitive linguistics can also be described as social, cultural and contextual linguistics. One manifestation of its cultural basis is the doctrine of encyclopedic semantics. An expression is meaningful by virtue of evoking a set of cognitive domains and imposing a certain construal on their content. Any kind of conceptualisation can function as a domain, and any facet of our open-ended knowledge of an entity can in principle be evoked as part of how an expression designating it is understood on a given occasion. In large measure these domains consist of cultural knowledge: most of what we say pertains to cultural constructions or to entities whose apprehension is in some way culturally influenced. Moreover, language itself is recognised as the creation and reflection of a culture as well as a primary instrument for its constitution and transmission (Langacker, 1997: 240-241).

Additionally, he has said:

is a bear, one must exercise great care when mapping frames of self-presentation from one belief system to the other.

[The] cultural concerns of cognitive linguistics are further manifested in the extensive investigation of metaphor [...]. From the cognitive standpoint, metaphor is characterised as a means of understanding one domain of experience in terms of another that is in some sense more fundamental. It is likely that most cognitive domains are metaphorically structured to some extent, and it is quite evident that metaphor is a major factor in cultural construction. Looking at the other side of the coin, we see that metaphor exhibits a substantial measure of conventionality – large numbers of metaphors have to be specifically learned as part of the acquisition of cultural knowledge. While the kinds and proportion of culturally transmitted metaphors have yet to be determined, it is clear that they play a significant role in language and cognition (Langacker, 1997: 241).

This point brings us to a more detailed analysis of the terms utilised in the present study. First, we need to clarify that in the context of this article the expression ‘Western worldview’ is intended only as a convenient shorthand, an analytical tool, whereas even that term is probably less than adequate, since we are talking of a broader set of beliefs, more in accord with the broader notion of a cultural cosmology, a view that embraces both earthly and cosmic aspects of human experience. As a shorthand tool, the expression Western (or westernised) worldview is used to refer globally to the overall constituent parts of a set of interlocking root metaphors understood intuitively by most speakers of English and indeed most European languages: it is a kind of model, a simulacrum, of the universe and all beings composing it. It has represented the conventional way to speak about the Nature of Things (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 208-213) because the root metaphors in question represent conventional modes of cognition that until quite recently have gone relatively unchallenged. As a result, for such speakers, the conceptual norms embedded in the Western cultural conceptualisations and patterns of thought appear to be commonsense ways of speaking about reality. Indeed, the Western interpretative norms, implicit in the construals of the colour terms analysed here, are recognised almost immediately by most English speakers. These deeply ingrained cognitive habits predispose us to produce, reproduce and retransmit the inherently hierarchical value system entrenched in these construals, relatively unconsciously, through acts that are, nonetheless, linguistically coded intonations of metaphors of dominance. This occurs perhaps because the interlocking and mutually reinforcing nature of the root metaphors continues to go unnoticed by most speakers.

In the West repeated efforts have been made to trace the cognitive origins of the cultural model known as the Great Chain of Being (Lovejoy, 1960 [1936]; Olds, 1992). The latter:

concerns not merely attributes and behaviour but also dominance. In this cultural model, higher forms of being dominate lower forms of being by virtue of their higher natures (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 208).

As Lakoff and Turner have pointed out, the Great Chain of Being:

is what is unconsciously taken for granted in a wide variety of cultures. But the Great Chain as it developed in the West, was far more elaborate. To the basic Great Chain there was added the Cultural Model of Macrocosm and Microcosm: each level of the chain was expanded to reflect the structure of the chain as a whole. At each level, there were higher and lower forms of being, with the higher forms dominating the lower (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 209).

For our purposes we should note that the:

existence of these global and microcosmic hierarchies in the cultural model of the Great Chain, and in its conscious elaboration in the West, has had profound social and cultural consequences, because the cultural model indicates that the Great Chain is a description not merely of what hierarchies happen to *exist* in the world, but further, of what hierarchies in the world *should be*. For example, it has been assumed that man should follow God, and woman should follow man, because the Great Chain indicates that this order of dominance is natural (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 210).

The intonations given by Christianity to the Great Chain of Being reappeared in even more virulent forms when they were incorporated into a different narrative of origins. The new formulation stripped away the Biblical underpinnings and claimed to explain in a purely secular fashion the cultural and linguistic heritage of European peoples, namely, by means of the so-called Aryan myth (Hutton, 1999; Koerner, 2000; Poliakov, 1974). That genealogical tale portrays a scenario in which European identity inevitably becomes conflated with that of a superior patriarchal race and culture (cf. Balibar and Wallerstein, 1996: 37-67; Sandikcioglu, 2000). Undoubtedly, the:

influence of the extended Great Chain on our social and political beliefs and behaviour is not merely a historical matter; it dominates much of contemporary social and political behaviour (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 211).

Finally, it should be noted that in recent years the notions:

that the state has dominion over the individual and that human beings have a natural right to use animals and the earth as they see fit without regard for the integrity of nature have been challenged as unethical or evil (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 212).

Therefore, for

whatever reason, perhaps because in our early cognitive development we inevitably form the model of the basic Great Chain as we interact with the world, it seems the Great Chain is widespread and has strong natural appeal. It implies that those social, political, and ecological evils induced by the Great Chain will not disappear quickly or easily or of their own accord. The Great Chain itself is a political issue. As a chain of dominance, it can become a chain of subjugation (Lakoff and Turner, 1989: 213).

In attempting to deal with the pervasive influence of Western cultural conceptualisations, one approach could be discovering and examining an alternative to it, namely, the Basque set of cultural schemas. In the context of the present study these schemas refer to persistent cultural conceptualisations that have survived in Euskal Herria, relatively unaffected by Christianity. Moreover, they still form an integral part of the symbolic coding in traditional folk performances, songs, poetry and dance, as well as being entrenched linguistically in the Basque language. Undoubtedly one of the major factors contributing to the preservation of Basque cultural schemas has been the fact that until quite recently traditional knowledge has been transmitted orally and almost exclusively from within the horizon of shared convictions and interpretive practices found in Basque-speaking zones. Therefore, often the underlying ontological and epistemological bases of the cosmology itself have been acquired in context against a rich background of congruent cultural practices, and, hence holistically (Sarrionandia, 1988: 9-13). As is true in the case of many traditional peoples, in such settings basic cultural schemas are transmitted through mechanisms typical of orality, 'hidden' or, perhaps better stated, 'preserved' in metaphoric constructs, material and linguistic artifacts as well as ritual practice (Cajete, 1994; Gerdes, 1997). In Euskal Herria these metaphoric constructs have been and continue to be brought into play repeatedly in the communicative process of identity formation.

Before concluding our broad overview of the differences holding between the two systems, a few additional theoretical considerations will be addressed. The Western

cultural schemas should be understood as a central component in the construction of European identity and notions of 'personhood'. Indeed, in the past these cultural conceptualisations appear to have functioned quite successfully to frame the process of self-identification for European peoples (Haarmann, 1995; Hutton, 1999; Poliakov, 1974: 5-8). Moreover, the primacy of a cultural group's symbolic maps can be seen in Alasdair MacIntyre's account of how personal identity is framed by the *shared narratives* of the group (MacIntyre, 1984). According to MacIntyre, what is particularly germane to arguments for changing the basis of self-identification is the following: that the mental/cultural processes of the past, and now encoded in the multiple metaphoric forms of communication that characterise a given culture, exist prior to the individual's entrance into the world. They are rarely questioned. They are encoded into the root metaphors that in turn become part of the traditions of a given people. The aforementioned cultural conceptualisations, therefore, play a crucial role in discourse and, hence, form the basis of the mutual intelligibility for the interlocking metaphors that underpin and, therefore, reinforce the shared narratives of the group, i.e.

whatever is persistent or recurrent through transmission, regardless of the substance or institutional settings (Bowers 1993: 93).²¹

In this sense, we may argue that these root metaphors act as the backgrounded, almost unconscious, symbolic map for the cultural group in question. For instance, the metanarrative encoded by means of the Western cultural schemas, taken collectively, is only one example of a set of similar *texts* that communicate messages far more complex and formative in terms of the person's behavioural/thought patterns than we might first assume. In other words, the schemas act as highly encapsulated narratives, so to speak, that love to tell the same story over and over again. Yet, as such, their story-telling often takes place beyond our level of conscious awareness. This plethora of signifiers reproduce cultural codes reflecting an earlier mental ecology with its signifiers framed by the categories and assumptions that made up its symbolic map. These patterns or schemas serve as the initial basis for how the individual will make use of the world, and they have particular relevance for ways of framing the process of self-identification. In summary, these root metaphors by means of their transference and multiple re-codings in the

structures intrinsic to the Western worldview have served Europeans as the basis for their self-identity providing them with a unique myth of origins. It is one that allows them to trace their ancestry back in time to putative Indo-European progenitors who, allegedly, shared the same patriarchal and hierarchical symbol system. Indeed, according to this European story of origins, the language(s) and culture(s) of the hypothesised Indo-Europeans shared precisely the same cultural understandings and conceptualisations found in the Western dataset being analysed in this study. Consequently, over time the cultural conceptualisations in question have served as key structural components in the process of European-identity formation and in the foundational metaphysics that accompanies these notions of self and ‘personhood’ (Poliakov, 1974: 129-325).

As is well recognised, there is a universal urge among human groups or cultures that leads them to claim a distinctive origin, an ancestry that is both high-born and glorious. Thus, the members of a human group descend from a god, or a hero or an animal. The genealogical myth is therefore the first type of historical thinking: the claim to common ancestors (Poliakov, 1974: 2-3). Therefore, there are aspects of cultural storage (traditions) that need to be taken into account by any theorist who wants to bring about significant changes in the way in which these ontological metaphors function for the latter continue to act as central components in the production of the *cultural scripts* employed by Europeans to think about their own identity.

The role played by cognitive linguistics in the theoretical formulation and analysis of such scripts has been fundamental. For instance, as Bowers has pointed out, the

recent writings of George Lakoff, Mark Johnson, and Donald Schon, in particular, have brought out different characteristics of metaphorical thinking that quickly move us out of the rarefied atmosphere of theory and into the contextualised and taken-for-granted world of culture (Bowers, 1993: 93).

Further, as Bowers has emphasised:

Cultures, it seems, are based on *root metaphors* (or what can be called *meta-narratives*, *world views* and now *paradigms* – though this term seems to be more appropriate to a Kuhnian-type discussion). The root metaphor (plural in the case of Western cultures) has changed over time; and if we examine various periods of Western history we find that the creation myth of the Book of Genesis served as a root metaphor that had a profound influence on subsequent cultural patterns [...] (Bowers, 1993: 93).

²¹ In this quote Bowers is citing Edward Shils’ use of the word *tradition* in Shils (1981: 216).

Moreover, for our purposes here, it is important to stress that:

our primary goal is to clarify how metaphorical thinking works as a process of cultural storage, reproduction, and (because thought is metaphorical) re-working old patterns into 'new' (in the weakest sense of the word) ones that will be conceptually coherent with the dominant root metaphor of the cultural group (Bowers, 1993: 93).

The connection between ideology and culture is also brought out in Clifford Geertz's definition:

Cultural patterns – religious, philosophical, aesthetic, scientific, ideological – are 'programmes'; that provide a template or blueprint for the organisation of social and psychological processes, much as genetic systems provide such a template for the organisation of organic processes (Geertz, 1973: 216).

Thus, ideology may be understood as 'a schema of understanding' produced through a discursive formation of language, consciousness, and social practice, a definition that brings out the more political aspects of the symbol systems along with their root metaphors which end up constituting a given culture (Bowers, 1993). In this sense, the sustaining power of the Nature of Being, that is, the conceptual framework derived from the Great-Chain-of-Being model, must be understood as a reflection of the central role that it has played historically in the constitution of European identity: it has acted as the primary schema or template, one that has organised many aspects of social practice in Europe for centuries. Its staying power results from the fact that in the West the cultural model in question became the dominant mode of thinking with respect to European identity. Indeed, the Western cosmology has endured and maintained its dominance because of its persistent and recurrent transmission in a myriad of authoritative texts (Balibar and Wallerstein, 1996; Poliakov, 1974). In short, it is a traditional way of thinking that has been sustained and fostered by European peoples, at times willingly, at others, less so. Notions concerning the European theory of origins have been handed down from the past to the present in such a way that those embracing the model are no longer aware of the factors that were present in its original formulation. In short, the root metaphors of the West represent a form of cultural storage, a tradition, a shared narrative that has survived by means of a series of mutually reinforcing interlocking metaphoric patterns of belief.

In this way, when viewed carefully, the narrative is one that concerns a discursive process which ended up accepting the asymmetric power relations implicit in these dualisms, white/black, culture/nature, man/woman, mind/body, etc. The dichotomous thought pattern has taken on a particular shape: just as white is superior to black, culture is superior to nature and so mind controls body. And, as Habermas (1994) has suggested, the lifeworld in question, represented here by this set of asymmetric dualist proportional metaphors in which each element lends support to the other, cannot be easily modified for we literally speak them back into being, over and over again. Given that they are so embedded in the common communicative ground of our daily speech acts, they, therefore, end up being almost invisible to the majority of speakers.²²

For this reason we can argue that this historical and culturally situated common ground of discourse is structured, in part, by certain metaphors that are relatively stable, enduring and pervasive and which, in turn, both support and are supported by non-linguistic activities, i.e. social practices, of the culture(s) in question.²³ In this sense, when this metaphoric repertoire acts in congruence with the non-linguistic mappings, it sets up a strong resonance with them (Emanatian, 1999). The resonance is activated by the fact that the concepts themselves, e.g. white/black, mind/body, culture/nature, function as ‘memory-banks’ (Ngũgĩ, 1986) with respect to the familiar, the *habitus* or common ground utilised, quite automatically, and non-ideologically by speakers in their daily communication. However, when the cultural model in question begins to be contested,

²² Here the supra-individual (inter-subjective) constitution of language itself comes into play, living, as it does, both at the level of ‘unitary language’ and at the level of ‘individual’ (socio-)linguistic practice. This tension or dynamic sets into motion changes, brought about through the interplay of Bakhtin’s (1981) two forces, one constituted by the centripetal (unitary and monologic) aspects of language and the other by the centrifugal (individual and heteroglossic) aspects of it. Schattenmann (forthcoming) offers the following relevant commentary:

In this respect, the ‘transcendental’ lifeworld [of Habermas] is similar to what Charles Taylor [1989, Chapter 2, esp. 36-39] calls our ‘transcendental’ dependence on ‘webs of interlocution’: we can change the web, but we cannot do without one [...]. It is interesting to note that language plays a central role in Habermas’ and Taylor’s argument and that both mention Wittgenstein and Wilhelm von Humboldt in this context.

For further commentary concerning this issue, cf. Habermas (1994).

²³ These, of course, fall roughly into a category that has been referred to in various ways, e.g. as ‘root metaphors’ (Pepper, 1942) and as ‘constitutive’ or ‘generative’ metaphors by (Smith, 1985), often with emphasis on their value as a heuristic. Cf. Kimmel (2002: 47-50) for more discussion of the concept of a metaphor’s *scope*, i.e. the overall power a metaphor exercises within a given conceptual system and how much it governs other elements of it. On this view, the broad scope of the nature/culture dichotomy and its metaphoric entailments is a particularly good example of a highly embedded and hence, resistant dyad belonging to the set of dualities under analysis.

these non-reflective discursive acts become conscious ones and in many cases sites of contestation and, hence, often ideologically charged (cf. Van Dijk, 2002). For this reason, we often encounter the co-existence of contradictory schemas, that is, incongruence, within the cultural model. For example, while the culture/nature : male/female analogy has frequently been a site of contestation, and even the culture/nature divide has sparked great debate, far fewer have tried to analyse the role played in the Western cultural paradigm by the polarity of the colours white and black. It is commonly assumed that their positive and negative valences were assigned by means of rational reflection on our natural surroundings, experiences that collectively brought about a consensus and ended up attributing a negative value to the colour black (cf. Hawkins, 2000).²⁴

4. Textual Exemplars

In this section we shall examine three brief texts, all dealing with issues treated in the previous pages of this study. Each will be analysed in terms of the way in which the Western and/or Basque cultural codes are manipulated discursively. Concretely, in the case of the first two selections the textual analysis will demonstrate the way in which the root metaphors, grounded in the foundational metaphysics of the West, act as a metanarrative. Stated differently, the Western coordinates have already mapped the cognitive terrain: they are already painted on the canvas before the first word is uttered. In short, as Haila (2000) has noted, these asymmetric dualisms draw their authority and truth-value from the (apparent) all pervasiveness of Western metaphysics. And even when one of the Western interlocking root metaphors comes under attack, the others come to its rescue. Because of their mutually reinforcing nature, they continue to provide the same fundamental cognitive scaffolding, the same underlying structures of metanarrativity.²⁵ Only in the case of the third exemplar do we discover a deliberate

²⁴ It should be noted that in the case of societies demonstrating relational epistemologies, this dichotomy is not present; either there is no word for what we understand as 'nature' or the individual's relationship to the surrounding world with all of its inhabitants, animate and inanimate, tends to be categorised in a radically different fashion (cf. Descola and Pálsson, 1996; Bird-David, 1999). Thus, the Western ontological divide between nature and culture is non-existent (as well as the particular Western hierarchy of values and dominance associated historically with this dyad and its metaphoric instantiations).

²⁵ For other examples and analysis of the interlocking and mutually supportive nature of these European cultural conceptualisations, cf. Hawkins (2000) and Sandikcioglu (2000). In contrast, cf. Müller (1888: x-xi) for a discussion of the role played by language and metaphor in reconstructing the civilisation of these Aryas.

subversion of the Western cultural conceptualisations themselves, collectively and individually. And that subversion is carried out not from the cognitive terrain of the European worldview. Rather the writer narrates from a different vantage point, one provided by the author's assumption of the reader's familiarity with Basque cultural conceptualisations and this dialogue, in turn, brings into play a very different kind of cognitive scaffolding.

4.1 Audre Lorde's Text

In the following text we discover once again the striking vertical axis characteristic of Western cultural schemas. The Western co-ordinate system is one with limited possibilities of movement. In addition, in the first exemplar we will see the role played by the colour black, an archival site for all that is hidden, secretive and dangerous. In short, Western cultural geometry is quite literally the pre-programmed background or cognitive grid already on the canvas. Thus, it represents the terrain upon which the following comments by Susan Griffin are mapped. The selection in question comes from her chapter called 'The way of all ideology' that is itself a discussion of the need to recognise 'false dichotomies' (cf. Murphy, 1994: 69-72) Yet in the process of critiquing these false dichotomies, the appropriateness of the backgrounded vertical orientation of the spatial co-ordinates of her own discourse is never subjected to critical scrutiny:

Audre Lorde has made an illuminating connection between this civilisation's fear of the associative and musical language of poetry (a language which comes from the depths of reason beneath rational consciousness, from the dark, unknown regions of the mind) and the same civilisation's fear of black skin, of the female, of darkness, the dark other, Africa, signifying an older, secret knowledge [...]. What is really feared is an open door into consciousness which leads us back to the old, ancient, infant and mother knowledge of the body, in whose depths lies another form of culture not opposed to nature but instead expressing the full power of nature and of our nature (Griffin, 1982: 154-65).

Griffin speaks of the need to bring about a dialogue between the two opposing sides of the Western asymmetric dualisms, this being a process she believes will result in the dissolution of the polarisation. Yet in the very act of doing so, the meaning of her text is dependent on the backgrounded networks of signifiers drawn directly from the play of root metaphors belonging to the Western dataset. Hence, in a sense Griffin's discourse, as

well as that of Lorde, are caught inside this web struggling to be free. In this fashion the very act of contestation and resistance ends up being carried out on the metaphoric ground of the enemy: the terms of debate are laid down by the Western patterns of thought. Consequently, while such texts speak at one level against the dualisms of the Western value system, at another they serve to reinforce the polarised logic inherent to it. Indeed, rather than introducing a new model, they actually act as archival sites for the interpretive habits and signifying practices of the Western cultural schemas. This occurs because the texts accept the overall validity of the ideological matrix and commonly only seek to reverse the polarity of one of its dyads. In such efforts, low-status black takes up the position previously held by high-status white. Or, as here, a plea is made for opening a doorway at the top of the stairs (or an entrance leading to the bottom of the cave). In short, in such cases the validity of the model's spatial geometry and its colour-coding goes unchallenged.

In such discursive practice, rather than finding the constraints imposed by the Western worldview removed, we detect a tendency on the part of writers to return again and again to familiar terrain, to the same referential model so that their very contestations become re-inscribed within its binary logic. Indeed, there might be those who would perceive Lorde's text to be particularly persuasive, well-constructed in terms of its manipulation of metaphoric understandings, precisely because it plays on the reader's emotional response, on the sympathetic recognition of precisely the most ingrained dyadic sets making up the Western cultural dataset. From this point of view, even when contesting the value system embedded in and exteriorised by the Western cultural schemas, we tend to write through it or across it.²⁶ In the process we are not altering its logic from the outside, but rather merely attempting to re-territorialise the same map. As a result, until the arbitrary, yet

²⁶ In her discussion of the Great-Chain-of-Being metaphor, Olds speaks at length about Western 'ontological metaphors'. Nonetheless, in her analysis she falls into the same trap:

The feminist concern most relevant to this discussion of ontological metaphors, however, involves perennial philosophy's ascription of differential degrees of reality and value to levels in the hierarchy, thus rendering a potential dichotomy between the highest Ultimate levels that transcend form and the lowest levels of tangible matter. The tendency in hierarchical ontology is thus to split spirit and matter, relegating the latter to inferior status. Feminist writers and theologians have been particularly articulate in addressing the dangers of this dichotomisation, and the ways in which woman, body, and nature by virtue of their cultural associations have carried *the dark side* of Western cultural valuing of Spirit, Reason, and Mind [...] (Olds, 1992: 406, emphasis added).

habitual nature, of the binary logic of cultural reference embedded in the Western metaphysical postulates is brought to the fore, the familiar model will continue to watch over our thoughts, ever seeking an opportunity to be reproduced by them. Only by introducing an alternative model, not a fictive or invented one, but rather cultural conceptualisations grounded historically, namely, Basque cultural schemas, does a cognitive positioning beyond the reach of Western metaphysics become accessible. And, as a point of reference, the Basque cultural conceptualisations make themselves available for more comparative approaches to the data. In other words, the Basque root metaphors permit the backgrounded cognitive frames as well as the interpretative habits of the Western model to come into clearer focus. And that process of reassessment will ultimately require recognition of the fundamental arbitrariness of the overall cultural model, including the historically constituted nature of the black/white colour-coding of found in Western thought.

4.2 Victor Turner's View

Our repeated reference to the arbitrary, namely, historically constituted nature of the Western system of colour-coding is an attempt on our part to counter claims of writers such as Victor Turner (1967: 84-86), who have sought to trace the origins of the hierarchical black/white colour-coding back to cognitive habits attributed to the early Indo-Europeans and even beyond. Indeed, we discover Turner arguing for a scenario in which the interpretative practices would be grounded in an even older pre-Indo-European tradition. A short selection from his writings will constitute our second textual exemplar. It comes from Turner's investigation of colour classification among the Ndembu where he tries to explain the ritual and symbolic use of the colour triad white-red-black and the dyadic one of white-black as being derivative of primordial psycho-biological experience. Of particular interest to us is the way his discussion of the significance of the white-black contrast reproduces the spatial coordinates and dyadic logic of the Western worldview. In his commentary Turner (1967: 59-92) never openly questions whether or not the coordinates of the Ndembu's worldview coincide fully with those characterising the Western one. Confident in his ability to read the backgrounded cultural understandings of his informants, there is little evidence that he was aware of his own predisposition to read

the value system embedded in the colour-coding of other cultures through his own strong bias toward the hierarchical dyads found in the Western cognitive grid.

A brief survey of the senses attributed by informants to 'white' and 'black' respectively indicates that these can mostly be arrayed in a series of antithetical pairs, as for example: goodness/badness; purity/lacking purity; lacking bad luck/lacking luck; lacking misfortune/misfortune; to be without death/death; life/death; health/disease; laughing with one's friends/witchcraft; to make visible/darkness and so forth [...]. Ndembu think of white and black as the supreme antitheses in their scheme of reality [...] (Turner 1967: 74).

Yet a closer look at the data that Turner himself provides in other sections of his work makes the truth-value of his last statement rather questionable. Nonetheless, he brings up the fact that it is:

characteristically human to think in terms of dyadic [antithetical] relations [...]. white and red, paired under the various aspects of male and female, peace and war, milk and flesh, semen and blood, are jointly 'life' [...]; both are opposed to black as death and negativity" (Turner 1967: 81).²⁷

Somewhat later he turns to the writings of ancient Hinduism, the Upanishads, in order to explain the embodied nature of the significance attributed to the basic colour triad, arguing that these attributes result from the association of the three colours with certain fluids, secretions or waste products of the human body:

Red is universally a symbol of blood, white is frequently a symbol of breast milk and semen [...], while, as we have seen the Chhāndogya Upanishad relates the black colour with feces and urine [...]. Among Ndembu, and in many other societies, both white and red may stand for life. When they are paired in ritual, white may stand for one alleged polarity of life, such as masculinity or vegetable food, while red may represent its opposite, such as femininity or meat. On the other hand, white may represent 'peace' and red 'war'; both are conscious activities as distinct from black which stands for inactivity and the cessation of consciousness (Turner, 1967: 88-89).

In order to elaborate further on his own descriptions of colour symbolism, Turner points out the hierarchical nature of the members of the triad:

In this Upanishad the colours are sometimes known as 'deities'. Examples are given of the way in which they manifest themselves in phenomena. Thus, 'food' when eaten becomes threefold. What is coarsest in it (the black part) becomes the feces, what is medium (the red part) becomes the flesh, and what is subtlest (the white part) becomes mind" (Turner 1967: 85). Hence, white is associated with

²⁷ In his comment concerning the 'characteristically human' propensity to think in terms of dyadic relations, he is citing Kempe (1890).

purity and tranquillity, being at the same time “the ‘subtlest’ or most ‘spiritual’ of the colours (Turner 1967: 86).

In addition, we can observe the Western mind/body dyad happily at work and that, because of its inherent spatial co-ordinates, the colour black inevitably ends up at the bottom of the heap. The vertical axis of the co-ordinate system has survived, fully intact.

In his discussion Turner not only accepts the validity of these assignments, he seems to be arguing that the model is nearly primordial:

It would seem probable that the notion of the colours is an inheritance from a remote (perhaps pre-Indo-European) past and that the Upanishadic texts are speculations of a later philosophy on this primordial deposit (Turner, 1967: 86).

There would seem to be little doubt that the philosophical speculations of the Upanishads have influenced European thought. Yet, one wonders to what extent the Western worldview was not busily reproducing itself in Turner’s own writings when he speaks of the perhaps pre-Indo-European or even primordial status of the model. In short, such statements allow him to subtly suggest that the hierarchical nature of the members of the triad, their colour-coding and valences are not culturally bound and produced, but rather that we should elevate them to the level of an eternal truth, a cognitive universal of human thought.²⁸

²⁸ There is, indeed, a dearth of self-conscious studies on the cognitive origins of this aspect of the Western worldview, namely, the black/white antithesis. And in relation to that topic, I would like to mention a recent article by Lucy entitled *The linguistics of ‘colour’* which appeared in a volume of essays on colour categories in thought and language. In his article Lucy takes the opportunity to call into question one aspect of the research methodology employed by linguists when discussing colour categories, namely, the

[c]onceptual muddles [that] abound with respect to how linguistic categories are characterised, how they are compared and how they are linked to cognition (Lucy, 1997: 321-322).

However, our purpose here is not to repeat Lucy’s critique but rather to highlight only one aspect of it, namely, the implications that might be derived from his comments concerning the methodology used in such comparative studies of colour terms:

Individual lexical items are culled from informants and their referential values established by a fixed denotational task. It really doesn’t matter what language the terms come from. Articles surveying terms in a dozen or more languages never mention anything about those languages, or even about the structural value of the terms. *You do not need to know anything about languages or linguistics at all to read this literature or even to conduct research within the tradition* [italics in the original] (1997: 330).

He then goes on to say:

This should give us pause since the tradition claims to be contributing to our understanding of the semantics of natural languages. You cannot generate a typology of ‘colour systems’ across languages without establishing that such systems actually exist as identifiable ‘systems’ in those languages (1997: 330).

The lack of interest on the part of such investigators in the structural value of colour terms in other language might reflect to some extent their assumptions concerning the universality of their own framework, as was the case with Turner.

4.3 Patziku Perurena's Counterpoint

At this stage we shall turn to another writing sample, this time that of Patziku Perurena, a Basque poet and essayist who himself has done extensive research on colour and number symbolism in Euskara. The same issues treated by Turner reappear at the beginning of Perurena's chapter on the colour term *zuria* 'white'. In fact, the chapter commences with a discussion of the same passages from Turner's book that we have just reviewed. Perurena then cites a few paragraphs from an earlier work of a like-minded Basque writer, Joseba Sarrionandia (1985: 215-218). These come from an essay by Sarrionandia also dealing with Turner's materials. Sarrionandia, like Perurena, is someone whose writings show a strong sense of commitment to the exploration and recuperation of Basque identity (cf. Sarrionandia, 1985; 1988) and, therefore, the metaphysical foundations inherent in the traditional Basque worldview. Over the past twenty years the poetry and essays of Sarrionandia have been models for many of those working in the field of Basque cultural and critical studies. In fact, just as in Perurena's case, Sarrionandia's essays and poems are characterised by their remarkable richness of imagery and firm grasp of the cultural conceptualisations making up the Basque worldview (cf. Azkorbebeitia-Aldaiturriaga, 1998).

However, in the passage that follows, Perurena takes Sarrionandia to task, tweaking his nose so to speak for having mis-spoken, that is, for having fallen into the trap of accepting uncritically the Western mode of thinking. In this section the significant element is the way in which Perurena identifies, draws out and then counters the polarities of the Western dataset. He does this by bringing into view the hierarchy implicit in its vertical axis and in its overall conceptual framework, a framework firmly grounded in antithetically opposed elements, i.e. in two sets of interlocking concepts. More concretely, on the one hand we find the series composed of 'white/mind/spirit/life/transcendence/high/purity', and then on the other hand, those of 'black/body/flesh/death/earthiness/low/defilement', on the other.²⁹ Perurena is fully cognizant of what he is doing. He begins by setting up an alternative model to Turner's

²⁹ As an aside, in the Western dataset we see that the polar opposite of 'transcendence' is 'earthiness'. In contrast we could argue that the Basque dataset is grounded in a relational epistemology and, thus, the notion of 'embodiment' and/or that of 're-inhabitation', the term employed by Gary Snyder (1995: 67-73); cf. also Brightman (2002a, b).

and hence to the one found in the Upanishads. At the same time he is aware of the fact that by contesting the Western cultural conceptualisations, he is reinforcing his reader's understanding of the Basque alternatives. And since he is writing in Euskara, Perurena knows that his interlocutor is already aware that *zuria* in Euskara carries a very different and somewhat negative charge. Therefore, Perurena has no need to overtly mention that *zuria* does not automatically trigger the interlocking metaphoric chain of values associated with the white set in the Western mode of thinking.³⁰ Rather, by introducing subtle linguistic clues, his discourse takes on a slightly ironic tone. In the process it highlights the dialogue being set up with the Euskaldun reader who is portrayed, therefore, as having access to two different metaphoric codes but whose identity and sense of personhood is firmly grounded in the relational epistemology characterising the Basque worldview.

In the narrative in question we find Perurena, in contrast to Lorde, refuting the validity of the Western model from the outside, not the inside. And in doing so he sets into motion a totally different model. In the process Perurena brings the Western root metaphors into plain view, one after another, stripping them of their sanctity, often with a ribald sense of humour that unfortunately is hard to capture in translation. The result is a self-reflexive text that suggests all sign systems are ideological and all ideologies possess semiotic value. In rewriting the discourse of Turner, the Upanishads and that of his friend Sarrionandia, we find Perurena engaged neither in a re-territorialisation of the same map, nor in a re-inscription of his discourse inside the boundaries of the same binary logic, i.e. by using the same signifying practices. Rather we find him taking part in a nuanced, multi-levelled and highly dialogic speech act. Its parodic capacity is based on the recognition and understanding of the allegedly authoritative nature of the Western cultural conceptualisations: his text recognises the other. And in doing so it reveals the inner workings of the Western construct. By the end, the Western worldview is totally reframed. This is done by offering the reader a means of transforming its geometry, reworking its vertical axis and hierarchical structure as well as its anthropocentric, rather

³⁰ The values system associated with the black/white dichotomy of the Western worldview can be contrasted with that of other cultures, e.g. the categories of the Hanunóo where 'black' is glossed as that which is 'dark, deep, unfading, indelible' in contrast to 'white' which is viewed as 'light, pale, weak, faded or bleached' (cf. Conklin, 1964 [1955]: 190 and Lucy, 1997: 322-326).

than eco-centric perspective. And at the same time the transformative nature of Perurena's discourse highlights the fact that the metaphoric understandings being manipulated are the authentic ones, those that underpin the Basque worldview and hence the frames of Basque identity, personhood and self-presentation.

In addition, Perurena's text brings to our attention the manner in which colours can act as archival sites for interpretive habits. For instance, with a flourish characteristic of contemporary *bertsolari* bards, often after a hard-fought singing contest, the image Perurena has been painting all along finally comes into full view. As is typical of *bertsolari* oral style, the full force of the metaphor must be kept hidden from view until the very last moment of the improvised performance in what is a self-consciously dialogic encounter between the poet-singer and his/her audience. If, at that precise instant when the singer is about to sing the last line of the poem, the audience also realises exactly what words are needed to complete the song and, therefore, to bring the metaphor to closure, that is, just seconds before the singer utters them, then the poet's performance is considered particularly successful. That way the final phrase, sung in unison by both the poet and his/her interlocutors, is concrete affirmation of the dialogic nature of the event: that both parties have been active participants in the creative act. That final flourish requires the speaker to be confident of his/her communicative abilities as well as of the interpretive skills of the members of the audience. Thus, at the end of Perurena's performance, we find the Western construct transformed, no longer hierarchical in nature, but rather heterarchical and, more remarkably, painted with a colour whose complex symbolism could only be understood by an insider, by someone familiar with the Basque worldview.

I, on the other hand, would like to point out a few things about the conclusions my friend Joseba finally arrived at using those ancient books of the *Upanishads*. First, though, let's clear the air of that smell of Eastern mysticism and bring the terms of the argument back down to a more earth-bound naturalism. Not only the food we swallow but also the nourishment ingested by every living being, however minimal, always leaves behind some residue or *excrement*. There you have your colour **black**. On the other hand, food turns into *blood* to give strength to the living body. There you have your colour **red**. And the supreme level of that living body is its *seed*, the first principle in the renewal of life, of the marrow of life. There you have your colour **white**. And then having brought them into fullness, wholeness, with no need for any upward-seeking hierarchical spirit or world-negating mysticism, we discover the three chief colours making up life's ring, a

circle without end. Why? Because the colour **black**, *excrement*, will act to fertilise, and **white**, capable of becoming flesh, will continue along its path converting itself into *blood*, consuming and strengthening the colour **red**, and thus *in saecula saeculorum*: the endless round of mutually beneficial encounters of three colours bringing into being the blue ring of life (Perurena, 1992: 173).³¹

In the Basque version of the text the word *urdina*, which we have translated very roughly as ‘blue’ in English, is actually the very last one uttered. The strategic placement of this word emphasises its key importance to the rest of the text and the fact that by positioning it in this way Perurena is imitating the highly respected oral style of *bertsolaritza* (Aulestia, 1995; Frank, 1989). Since the complex meanings of the colour ‘blue’ in Euskara do not show through in any manner in the English translation, we shall cite several lines that appear in the previous chapter of Perurena’s own book, a chapter dedicated to exploring the semantic field of the colour *urdina* in Euskara. The section in question is one the reader would have finished reading just minutes before starting the next chapter where the quotation we have just discussed appears. Stated differently, when the reader encounters the strategic placement of *urdina* in the text above, s/he recognises that Perurena is quoting himself: that the text is self-referential. Perurena expects the reader to remember what he has just said a few pages earlier.

Speaking of the colour *urdina* he says:

It’s always in the maybe-maybe, betwixt and between place [referring to]: not young not really old; not white not black [...] not entirely dirty not entirely clean [...] (*Duda mudako lekutan da beti: ez gazte ez txoil zahartu [...] ez zuri ez beltz [...] ez txoil zikin ez txoil garbi [...]*) (Perurena, 1992: 168).

By organising the last sentence of his text so that it ends smartly on the word *urdina* (*bizitzaren eraztun urdina*), Perurena introduces an insider joke, thumbing his nose at those silly Basques who might be prone to operate, however unconsciously, from within

³¹ Nik, ekialdeko mistizismo kutsua kendu eta begibistako naturalismo lurtarrago bihurtuz, honelatsu zehaztuko nituzke Joseba adiskideak azkenean *Upanishad* delako liburu zahar horietatik ateratzen dituen ondorioak. Guk irensten dugun janaria ezezik munduko edozein izaki bizidunak bereganatzen duen elikaduraren alderdirik eskasena beti hondakin edo *gorotz* bihurtzen da, horra hor kolore **beltza**; beste alderdia *odol* bihurtzen da, gorputz bizidunari indar emateko, horra hor kolore **gorria**; eta gorputz bizidun horren mailarik gorena, bere *hazia*, bizi berritartako lehengaia, bizimuina, horra hor kolore **zuria**. Eta hara osatu, inolako izpiritu goitarrik eta mistizismorik gabe, bizitzaren eraztuna isten duten hiru kolore nagusien zirkulu etenik gabea. Zeren, gero kolore **zuria**, *hazia*, kolore **beltzak**, *gorotzak* ongarrituko baitu, eta *hazia* gizendu ahalean *odol* bihurtzen joanen baita, kolore **gorria** bereganatuz eta indartuz, eta horrela *in saecula*

the narrow confines of the antithetical polarities of the colour-coding and associated interpretive habits of the Western cultural schemas. Namely, he implicates those people who might allow their cultural identity to be defined for them by such an ideological matrix.³² And in adding this final flourish, Perurena gently reminds Sarrionandia and his reader once again that there is more at stake here than meets the eye. When one accepts white as transcendental spirituality, as pure essence, as disembodied, non-material upward seeking of being, one enters a world typical of caste systems where there is constant fear of defilement and pollution by lower beings. Indeed, in such caste systems we find that the opposition of pure and impure is fundamental to hierarchy (Dumont, 1961: 34), whereas there are sanctions against inequality in a clan situation (Titiev, 1942).

Thus, the transformative betwixt-and-between nature of ‘the blue ring of life’ draws attention to a specific ordering of the ‘created cosmos’, one characterised by cyclical motion, relations of equality and in which complementarity and reciprocity are emphasised. In addition, the inequality implicit in the power relations built into the Western worldview as well as its obsessive fear of mingling, miscegenation and blends of all types is brought to the surface.³³ Moreover, speaking broadly, a cultural paradigm characterised by a dichotomous metaphysics often gives primacy to belief in a principle of hierarchy or inequality, viewed as innate or immanent in nature itself, whereas in the case of a worldview characterised by a trophic metaphysics, relationships between social

saeculorum: hiru koloreen elkar hornitze etengabeak osatuko du bizitzaren eraztun urdina. (Perurena, 1992: 173). All translations from Basque to English by the author.

³² At this point the reader’s identity is obviously being interrogated by the text itself. There is no question that Perurena is playing with the semantic field of *urdina* by setting up a contrast between its meaning and those antithetical black/white oppositions typifying the Western pairings. What is less clear is whether he is also introducing another level of irony by his use of the phrase *inolako izpiritu goitarrik* that our translation renders as ‘any upward-seeking, hierarchical spirit’. The difficulty arises because the field of referentiality of the expression *goitarrik* could be interpreted at one level as ‘upward-seeking, hierarchical’ as we have chosen to do, or at another as ‘someone or thing associated with (the) on-high’. Since the expression *goitar* is also used as a nickname for Castilians, i.e. Spaniards (cf. Azkue 1969, I, 356). Perurena’s careful choice of words introduces a certain ambiguity into the text, a multi-voicing or heteroglossia. The term is polysemous having two referents, both of which are equally logical and applicable in this context for we need to keep in mind that the ideological debate is over which set of root metaphors will end up determining the reader’s sense of identity and in this case there is a chance that Perurena’s interlocuter will be bilingual in Euskara and Castilian-Spanish and, as a result, capable of accessing both codes at the same time.

³³ Perhaps the best study to date concerning the psychological aspects of the Aryan myth, the most virulent form taken by the dominant Western asymmetric polarities, is that of Theweleit (1977-78; 1987; 1988).

actors tend to be founded on the belief in an innate principle equality and reciprocity.³⁴ Following Bakhtin's lead, the 'created cosmos' of the first system, the Western dataset, is vertically oriented and entirely monologic: its *white* side does not admit, yet alone recognise the agency of the other, the *black* half of the equation. Rather it is grounded on an active/passive, agent/object mode of action. In contrast, the second model, the Basque worldview, is reflexive and dialogic in nature.

For instance, in the performance pieces we mentioned earlier, it is the *interaction* between the Beltzak (Blacks) and Gorriak (Reds) that is fundamental. The parodic nature of the Beltzak is dependent on their recognition of the presence and agency of the Gorriak, even though the Gorriak do not reciprocate nor are they expected to do so. In this sense, the Gorriak might be viewed as Bakhtin's single-voiced word that, in contrast to the double-voiced word, does not take into account another speaker's utterance but focuses solely on the object of speech. It is seen as being monologic, irrefutable or as not brooking dispute. Such an authoritative word is necessary for order. However, equally important is the ability to reframe that order, to dissolve boundaries. Stated differently, the role assigned to the Beltzak performers is crucial: the function of boundary dissolution. They provide mechanisms for an ongoing state of self-transformation and reflexivity. Their nature is dialogical first of all because they take cognizance of another's word either prior to or at the very moment of its utterance. Thus, it is the task of the Beltzak to introduce a dimension of reflexivity into the 'serious' performance³⁵ and, in

³⁴ Stated differently, each type of metaphysics appears to project one or the other of these 'innate' principles onto the structure of the natural world, and then to read that structure back to justify the innateness of the principle itself and its application to social interactions.

³⁵ In those performance pieces of Basque popular theatre that reproduce and re-elaborate diverse elements pertaining to the pan-European genre of 'good-luck visits', the *Beltzak* clearly play the role of ritual clowns. Their functions are very similar to those of the False-Face healers of the Iroquois, the Heyokas of the Sioux and the Koyemshi clowns of the Zuni Pueblo (Time-Life, Editors, 1992: 142-147). Furthermore, the ritual confrontation, opposition and reconciliation, orchestrated between the Capakobam and the Kachina 'deity-figures' of the Hopi bring into play many of the same structures found in the *Beltzak* and *Gorriak* performances (Handelman, 1981: 346-351). Fortunately, in recent years investigators, such as Handelman (1981) have finally broken free from the constraints of the Western mindset in their analysis of the structural importance of these actors. Indeed anyone familiar with the trajectory of these studies will recognise that the explanatory paradigms for ritual clowns run roughly parallel to those utilised in anthropological linguistics (cf. Hieb, 1972). In reference to alternate cultural paradigms that, in the future, might be examined for comparative purposes, a closer look should be given to the colour-coding of the Haudenosaunee or Iroquois, their red-white divisions as well as to the red-white contrast of the Algonquians (red-black in the case of the Oklahoma Delaware). This is because it is this complementary colour-coded set that their False-Face healers, their sacred clowns, manipulate ritually in their ceremonies (Craver 1996; Frank, 2001b; Hewlett, 1916a: 128; 1916b: 243-244; Speck, 1945: 20-24).

the process, bring to the fore inconsistencies of meaning and referential ambiguities: dissolving the monologic framing. The *Beltzak* stand for all that is unstable, fluctuating, in-movement and in-transition.

Handelman has spoken at length on the central role of such ritual clowns:

[t]herefore, the routine focus is not on the boundary itself but instead on the form and content of what lies on either side of it. The boundary is accepted as matter-of-fact – a constant that organises, keeps, and compartmentalises various elements in their proper place. But, if one’s focus shifts to the constitution of the ‘boundary’ itself, to its internal organisation, it becomes evident that boundaries are inherently paradoxical. [...] The boundary itself is of a different property from that which is located on either side of it, because it is an amalgam of whatever adjoins it (Handelman, 1981: 340–341).³⁶

The boundary has a sense of being ‘in-between’ or ‘in the middle’ of what it separates and combines. In its organisation Perurena’s ‘blue ring of life’, like that of the ritual-clown type, is in a state of oscillation marked by qualities of movement, fluidity, plasticity and transition. In short, its geometry and colour-coding are far different from those features characterising the Western dualisms we have analysed in this study.

Conclusion

In summary, the data brought forward in this study form part of a larger project dedicated to the recuperation of the trophic metaphysics embedded in what I argue was an earlier pan-European eco-centric cosmology. Central to that effort has been the analysis of the cultural conceptualisations functioning in a set of contemporary folk performances encountered across much of Europe, most particularly the ‘good-luck visits’ involving

³⁶ One of the unanswered questions is whether Euskara’s typological status as a ‘unitiser’ language could be a factor in shaping these cognitive propensities focused on the ‘betwixt and between’ and acts of boundary dissolution (cf. Levinson, 1996: 185; Lucy 1996a; 1996b; Helen Watson, 1990). Specifically we refer to the fact that Euskara is like Yucatec in that:

[i]t is only by collocation with a numeral classifier or some other shape-discriminating phrase that [...] nouns can come to designate countable entities. This thesis, carried to its logical extreme, would amount to the claim that all nominals in Yucatec [and Euskara] are essentially *mass* nouns and that the language makes no ontological commitment to *entities* as opposed to materials, essence or ‘stuff’ at all. In order to individuate entities, a numeral classifier or some predicate is required to impose individuation on the material, metaphorically in much the way that a cookie-cutter cuts up undifferentiated dough! (Levinson, 1996: 185).

Hence, such languages deal with boundaries in a different way than do those predicated on preexistence or ‘given’ status of spatio-temporal particulars. Therefore it might follow that for speakers of ‘unitiser’ languages the ontological ground of being is constituted in another fashion. Cf. Frank (forthcoming b) for a much more detailed account of these aspects of the ontology of Euskara.

human actors dressed as bears who function as healers, bringers of good health, along with other performers with a similar function, dressed in black (cf. Frank 2001a; forthcoming b).³⁷ The present article summarises some of my results to date and hopefully has made clear the reasons for which I state that the cultural conceptualisations found in Euskara should not be understood as archaic geographical isolates. Rather, taken collectively, they should be viewed as perhaps the best-preserved exemplar of the culturally entrenched root metaphors that characterised this earlier, yet still recoverable, pan-European cosmology.³⁸

Finally, at a point in time when English is rapidly being installed as the *de facto* language of international communication and winds of globalisation are sweeping across the planet, levelling cultural differences and making the imposition of a monoculture a real possibility, if not an inevitability, it is worthwhile to remember these words, written by Benjamin Whorf many years ago:

But to restrict thinking to the patterns merely of English, and especially to those patterns which represent the acme of plainness in English is to lose a power of thought which, once lost, can never be regained. It is the 'plainest' English which

³⁷ Materials used for the bear actor's costume have included animal furs, sheepskins, dog pelts, colourful strips of cloth as well as moss and/or leaves, while the actors, sometimes called 'men of the forest' as were bears themselves, are identified also as 'wild-men' or *basa-jaunak* (cf. Bartra, 1994; Giroux, 1984; Truffaut, 1988; Urbeltz, 1994).

³⁸ My choice to use colour-coding as the defining characteristic of the two models has been motivated by a series of ontological and epistemological considerations outside the scope of this introductory study. In other words, the very way in which we conceptualise 'matter-stuff' is a reflection of the foundational postulates of westernised thought: matter or being is represented as black dots on a white void, islands floating in pure nothingness. Furthermore, in Western thought 'sortal nouns' appear as givens, spatio-temporal particulars set against this emptiness. As Whorf, too, has noted, every complex of a culture has carried with it an implicit metaphysics:

Thus, the implicit metaphysics of SAE [Standard Average European languages] culture presupposes [...] a universe consisting of: a) a void or 'holes'; b) substance or matter which has 'properties' and forms island-like 'bodies,' an absolute unbridgeable difference between the matter and the 'holes' [...], things happening to matter, nothing happening in the void (Whorf and Trager, 1996: 264).

Undoubtedly these contrasts result from deeply backgrounded notions of 'being' (cf. Barton and Frank, 2001; Frank, forthcoming b). For this reason, we are now looking for what we might call QRS systems, that is, systems by which we make meaning of quantity, relationships and space in Euskara. In that process we are seeking to define certain fundamental aspects of these systems that ended up embedded in the language: the culturally and linguistically-given cognitive templates that give rise to certain cultural conceptualisations. The templates, therefore, represent the underlying, linguistically embedded ontological and epistemological basis for particular cognitive habits and perceptual propensities and it is the both the former (the cognitive templates) and the latter (the cognitive habits and perceptual propensities) that are constitutive elements for such QRS systems and the mathematical thinking that accompanies them. The templates themselves set up cognitive grids. Perceptually, these patterns act in a systematic fashion to filter out those elements that will not be attended to cognitively while capturing those that will be.

contains the greatest number of unconscious assumptions about nature. [...]. For this reason I believe that those who envision a future world speaking only one tongue, whether English, German, Russian, or any other, hold a misguided ideal and would do the evolution of the human mind the greatest disservice. Western culture has made, through language, a provisional analysis of reality and, without correctives, holds resolutely to that analysis as final. The only correctives lie in all those other tongues which by aeons of independent evolution have arrived at different, but equally logical, provisional analyses (Whorf, 1956: 244).

In conclusion, instruments of analysis drawn from the field of cultural linguistics have allowed us to explore the communicative conceptual horizon of two incommensurate sets of cultural conceptualisations. By comparing the backgrounded cultural schemas making up the cognitive network underpinning each set we have been able to discover patterns of thought that have had multiple supports, including congruent social practices. At the same time, it is clear that in recent years several junctures of the Western polarities have come under attack because of changing societal norms. Still, until now, the white/black colour-coding of the Western worldview has not been scrutinised to any significant extent. In this sense, the current study sets forth only the initial investigative steps for what should be taken into consideration in a much more exhaustive exploration of the foundational metaphysical ground of the older pan-European cosmology, whose basic structures have been sketched out, ever so lightly, in this chapter.³⁹

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere appreciation to Dr. Farzad Sharifian for his helpful comments and suggestions on an earlier draft of this paper.

³⁹ The trophic metaphysics of the old European cosmological system is examined in more detail in a separate study called 'Hunting the European Sky Bears: The darker side of Santa' (Frank, in preparation).

References

- Alaiza, Carol Ann (1978) *Santa Grazi Pastoralas: A critical study of the Basque Pastoralas as contemporary tradition*. Unpublished Ph.D dissertation, University of California.
- Alford, Violet (1928) The Basque Masquerade. *Folklore* XXXIX (March): 67-90.
- Alford, Violet (1930) The Springtime Bear in the Pyrenees. *Folklore* XLI (Sept.): 266-279.
- Alford, Violet (1931) The Candlemas Bear. *National and English Review* (Feb.): 235-244.
- Alford, Violet (1937) *Pyrenean Festivals: Calendar Customs, Music and Magic, Drama and Dance*. London: Chatto and Windus.
- Aulestia, Gorka (1995) *Improvisational Poetry from the Basque Country*. Reno: University of Nevada Press.
- Azkorbebeitia-Aldaiturriaga, Aitzpea (1998) *Joseba Sarrionandia: Irakurketa Proposamen Bat*. Bilbao: Labayru Ikastegia Amorebieta-Etxanoko Udala.
- Azkue, Maria Resurreccion (1969) *El diccionario vasco-español-francés*. Bilbao: La Gran Enciclopedia Vasca.
- Azurmendi, Jose (1991) *Gizaberearen Bakeak eta Gerrak*. Donostia: Elkar.
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1973) *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*. Translation: R. W. Rotsel. Ann Arbor: Ardis.
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1981) *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Michael Holquist (ed.). Translation: Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Balibar, Etienne and Wallerstein, Immanuel (1996) *Race, Nation and Class: Ambiguous Identities*. London and New York: Verso.
- Balzer, Marjorie Mandelstam (1996) Sacred genders in Siberia: Shamans, bear festivals and androgyny. In: Sabrina Petra Ramet (ed.) *Gender Reversals and Gender Cultures*. London and New York: Routledge, 164-182.
- Barandiaran, Jose Miguel de (1974) *Obras completas*. Bilbao: La Gran Enciclopedia Vasca.
- Barton, Bill and Frank, Roslyn (2001) Mathematical ideas and indigenous languages. In: Bill Atweh, Helen Forgasz and Ben Nebres (eds.) *Sociocultural Research in Mathematics Education: An International Perspective*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 135-149.
- Bartra, Roger (1994) *Wild Men in the Looking Glass: The Mythic Origins of European Otherness*. Translation: Carl T. Berriford. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press.
- Bird-David, Nurit (1999) 'Animism' revisited: On personhood, environment and relational epistemology. *Current Anthropology* 40 (Supplement): S67-S91.
- Bowers, Chet (1993) Some questions about the theoretical foundations of W. Fox's transpersonal ecology and Arne Naess' ecosophy T. *Trumpeter*, 10.3 (Summer): 92-98. Available at: <http://trumpeter.athabascau.ca/content/v10.3/Bowers.html> (consulted 25th November, 2006)

- Brightman, Robert (2002a) Monisms, dualisms and ecological noble savages. Presentation at the Ninth International Conference on Hunting and Gathering Societies, Edinburgh, Sept 9-13, 2002. Available at: <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/chags9/1brightman.htm> (Consulted, 15th May 2003)
- Brightman, Robert (2002b) *Grateful Prey: Rock Cree Human-Animal Relationships*. Regina, Saskatchewan: Canadian Plains research Center, University of Regina.
- Brunton, Bill B. (1993) Kootenai shamanism. In: Mihály Hoppál and Keith D. Howard (eds.) *Shamans and Cultures*. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó, International Society for Trans-Oceanic Research, Los Angeles, 136-146.
- Cajete, Gregory (1994) *Look to the Mountain: An Ecology of Indigenous Education*. Durango, Colorado: Kivakí Press.
- Caro Baroja, Julio (1965) *El carnaval (análisis histórico-cultural)*. Madrid: Taurus.
- Cienki, Alan (1999) Metaphors and cultural models as profiles and bases. In: Raymond W. Gibbs, Jr. and Gerard J. Steen (eds.) *Metaphors in Cognitive Linguistics: Selected Papers from the Fifth International Cognitive Linguistics Conference*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 189-203.
- Conklin Harold C. (1964 [1955]) Hanundóo colour categories. In: Dell Hymes (ed.) *Language in Culture and Society: A Reader in Linguistics and Anthropology*. New York: Harper and Row, 189-192. (Originally published in *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology* [1955] 11(4): 339-344).
- Corradi-Musi, C. (1989) Finno-Ugric shamanism and European magic. In: Mihály Hoppál and Juha Pentikäinen (eds.) *Uralic Mythology and Folklore*. Budapest: Ethnographic Institute of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences/Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society, 239-250.
- Cosquin, Emmanuel (1887) *Les Contes populaires de Lorraine*. Paris: F. Vieweg, Libraire-Editeur.
- Craver, Forrest (1996) Finding our place on earth again: An interview with John Stokes. In: Cass Adams (ed.) *The Soul Unearthed: Celebrating Wildness and Personal Renewal through Nature*. New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 63-70.
- Creighton, Helen (1950) *Folklore of Lunenburg County, Nova Scotia*. No. 117. Bulletin (National) Museum of Canada, Biological Series. Ottawa: F. A. Ackland.
- Damasio, Antonio (1994) *Descartes' Error: Emotion, Reason and the Human Brain*. New York: Grosset/Putnam Book.
- Danow, David K. (1984) M. M. Bakhtin's concept of the word. *American Journal of Semiotics* 3(1): 79-97.
- Descola, Philippe and Pálsson, Gisli (eds.) (1996) *Nature and Society: Anthropological Perspectives*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Dialogues basques* (1857) London.
- Dumont, Louis (1961) Caste, racism and 'stratification': reflections of a social anthropologist. *Contribution to Indian Sociology* 5: 20-43.
- Emanatian, Michele (1999) Congruence by degree: On the relation between metaphor and cultural models. In: Raymond W. Gibbs and Gerard Steen (eds.) *Metaphor in Cognitive Linguistics*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 205-218.
- Fabre, Daniel (1968) *Jean L'ours: Analyse formelle et thématique d'un Conte populaire*. Carcassonne: Editions de la Revue 'Folklore'.

- Fabre, Daniel (1986) Le carnaval de l'ours à Saint-Laurent de Cerdans. In: Claude Dendaletche (ed.) *L'Ours Brun: Pyrénées, Agruzzes, Mts. Cantabriques, Alpes du Trentin*. Pau: Acta Biologica Montana, 146-148.
- Fernández de Larrinoa, Kepa (1997) *Mujer, ritual y fiesta*. Pamplona/Iruña: Pamiela.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1977) The religious role of the woman in Basque culture. In: William A. Douglass, Richard W. Etulain and William H. Jacobsen, Jr. (eds.) *Anglo-American Contributions to Basque Studies: Essays in Honor of Jon Bilbao*. Reno: University of Nevada Press, 153-160.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1989) Singing duels and social solidarity: The case of the Basque *charivari*. In: William A. Douglass (ed.) *Essays in Basque Social Anthropology and History*. Reno: Basque Program, 43-80.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1996) Hunting the European Sky Bears: When bears ruled the earth and guarded the gate of heaven. In: Vesselina Koleva and Dmitir Kolev, (eds.) *Astronomical Traditions in Past Cultures*. Sofia: Institute of Astronomy, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, National Astronomical Observatory Rozhen, 116-142.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1997) Hunting the European Sky Bears: The Grateful Eagle, Little Bear, Amirani and Prometheus. In: Carlos Jaschek and Fernando Atrio-Barandela (eds.) *Actas del IV Congreso de la SEAC "Astronomía en la Cultura"/Proceedings of the IV SEAC Meeting 'Astronomy and Culture'*. Salamanca, Spain: Universidad de Salamanca, 55-68.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1999a) An essay in European ethnomathematics: the social and cultural bases of the *vara de Burgos* and its relationship to the Basque Septuagesimal System. *ZDM. Zentralblatt für Didaktik der Mathematik* 31, 2 (April):59-65. Available at:
<http://www.fiz-karlsruhe.de/fiz/publications/zdm/zdm992a.html#frank>
- Frank, Roslyn M. (1999b) An Essay in European Ethnomathematics: The Basque Septuagesimal System. Part I. In: Arnold Lebeuf and Mariusz S. Ziolkowski (eds.) *Actes de la V^{ème} Conférence Annuelle de la SEAC. Gdansk 1997*. Warszawa-Gdansk: Département d'Anthropologie Historique, Institut d'Archéologie de l'Université de Varsovie – Musée Maritime Central, 119-142.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (2001a) Euskal Herriko eginkizun erligiosoaren inguruko azterketa diakronikoa: Serora eta bere laguntzaileak. In: Miguel Angel Barcenilla *et al.* (eds.) *La mujer en Euskal Herria: Hacia un feminismo propio*, 65–103 Donostia: Basandere. Argitaletxea. [English translation available at:
<http://www.uiowa.edu/~spanport/personal/Frank/Frankframe.htm>].
- Frank, Roslyn M. (2001b) Hunting the European Sky Bears: Candlemas Bear Day and World Renewal Ceremonies. In: C. R. N. Ruggles, Frank Prendergast, and Tom Ray (eds.) *Astronomy, Cosmology and Landscape. Proceedings of the Seventh Annual Conference of the European Society of Astronomy in Culture* (Dublin, Ireland, 1998). Bognor Regis, England: Ocarina Press, 133-157.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (2003a) Shifting identities: The metaphors of nature-culture dualism in Western and Basque models of self. *Metaphorik.de*. 04/2003.
<http://www.metaphorik.de/04/frank.pdf>.

- Frank, Roslyn M. (2003b) Shifting identities in Basque and Western cultural models of self and being. In: René Dirven, Roslyn M. Frank and Martin Pütz (eds.) *Cognitive Models in Language and Thought*. Berlin / New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 123-157.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (forthcoming a) Hunting the European Sky Bears: A diachronic analysis of Santa Claus and his helpers. In: Paul Bahn (ed.) *An Enquiring Mind: Papers in Honour of Alexander Marshack*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (forthcoming b) Linguistic relativity and the question of language-specific ontology: An exploration of the ontological commitments of the Basque language. In: Vyvyan Evans and Paul Chilton (eds.) *Language, Cognition and Space: The State of the Art and New Directions (two volumes)*. London: Equinox Publishing Company. Advances in Cognitive Linguistics Series.
- Frank, Roslyn M. (in preparation) Hunting the European Sky Bears: The darker side of Santa.
- Frank, Roslyn M. and Arregi Bengoa, Jesus (2001) Hunting the European Sky Bears: On the origins of the non-zodiacal constellations. In: C. R. N. Ruggles, Frank Prendergast and Tom Ray (eds.) *Astronomy, Cosmology and Landscape. Proceedings of the Seventh Annual Conference of the European Society of Astronomy in Culture* (Dublin, Ireland, 1998). Bognor Regis, England: Ocarina Press, 15-43.
- Frank, Roslyn M. and Houser, Michael J. (2004) Shifting identities: Metaphoric communicative competence in Western and Basque cultural models. Presentation at the 30th International LAUD Symposium, *Empowerment through Language*. April 19-22, 2004. University of Koblenz–Landau, Landau, Germany.
- Frank, Roslyn M. and Patrick, Jon D. (1993) The geometry of pastoral stone octagons: the Basque *sarobe*. In: C. L. N. Ruggles (ed.) *Archaeoastronomy in the 1990s*, Loughborough, England: Group D Publications, 77-91.
- Gaiak Argitaldaria (1995) *Pirinioak eta Euskal Herria: Mitoak eta Sineskizunak*. Donostia: Gaiak.
- Galfarsoro, Imanol (1998) Symbolic violence and linguistic *habitus* in Pierre Bourdieu: An instance of the ‘language is power’ view revisited. In: Imanol Galfarsoro (ed.) *The Basque Case: Readings in Language, Culture, Identity and Politics*. (Internet-Version/10.07.2004: www.ibs.lgu.ac.uk/forum/diaspo1.htm).
- Galfarsoro, Imanol (2000) An incursion into the realm of travelling cultures and diaspora politics. In: Imanol Galfarsoro (ed.) *The Basque Case: Readings in Language, Culture, Identity and Politics*. (Internet-Version/10.07.2004: www.ibs.lgu.ac.uk/forum/diaspo1.htm).
- Geertz, Clifford (1973) *The Interpretation of Culture* (New York: Basic Books).
- Gerdes, Paul (1997) On culture, geometrical thinking and mathematics education. In: Arthur B. Powell and Marilyn Frankenstein (eds.) *Ethnomathematics: Challenging Eurocentrism in Mathematics Education*. Albany: State University of New York, 223-247.
- Gifford, Douglas (1979) Witchcraft and the problem of evil in a Basque village. *Folklore* 90(1): 11-17.
- Gil Bera, Eduardo (1990) *Fisikaz Honatago*. Pamplona/Iruña: Pamiela.

- Gingerich, Owen (1984) Astronomical scrapbook. The origin of the zodiac. *Sky and Telescope* 67 (March): 218-220.
- Giroux, Françoise (1984) *Carnavals et Fêtes d'Hiver*. Paris: Centre Georges Pompidou, e.d.l.e.c.
- Glosecki, Stephen O. (1989) *Shamanism and Old English Poetry*. New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc.
- Goodenough, Ward H. (1957) Cultural anthropology and linguistics. In: Paul L. Garvin (ed.) *Report of the 7th Annual Round Table Meeting on Linguistics and Language Study*. Monograph Series on Languages and Linguistics, no. 9. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 167-173.
- Griffin, Susan (1982) *Made from this Earth: an Anthology of Writings*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Haarmann, Harald (1995) Europeanness, European identity and the role of languages. *Sociolinguistica* 9: 1-55.
- Habermas, Jürgen (1982) Erläuterungen zum Begriff des kommunikativen Handelns. In: *Vorstudien und Ergänzungen zur Theorie des kommunikativen Handelns*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 571-606.
- Habermas, Jürgen (1987) [1981]. The theory of communicative action, Vol. 2. *Life-World and System: A Critique of Functionalist Reason*. Translation: Thomas McCarthy. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Habermas, Jürgen (1994) Actions, speech acts, linguistically mediated interactions and the lifeworld. In: Guttorm Floistad (ed.) *Philosophical Problems Today, Vol. 1*. Dordrecht/Boston: Kluwer, 45-74.
- Habermas, Jürgen (1997) [1988] *Nachmetaphysisches, Denken. Philosophische Aufsätze*. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Haila, Yrjö (2002) Beyond the nature-culture dualism. *Biology & Philosophy* 15: 155-175.
- Hallowell, A. Irving (1960) Ojibwa ontology, behaviour, and world view. In: Stanley Diamond (ed.) *Culture in History: Essays in Honor of Paul Radin*. New York: Columbia University Press, 19-52.
- Handelman, Dan (1981) The ritual-clown: attributes and affinities. *Anthropos*, 76: 321-370.
- Harner, Michael (1980) *The Way of the Shaman: A Guide to Power and Healing*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Hartsuaga, Juan Ignazio (1987) *Euskal Mitologia Konparatua*. Donostia: Kriselu.
- Hawkins, Bruce (2000) Ideology, metaphors and iconographic reference. In: René Dirven, Roslyn M. Frank and Cornelia Ilie (eds.) *Language and Ideology. Vol. 2. Descriptive Cognitive Approaches*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 27-50.
- Hérelle, Georges (1914-17) Les Mascarades souletines. *Revista Internacional de Estudios Vascos* VIII (année 1914): 368-385.
- Hewlett, J. N. B. (1916a) *Explorations and Field Work of the Smithsonian Institution in 1916*. Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections, Vol. 66, No. 17.
- Hewlett, J. N. B. (1916b) *A Constitutional League of Peace in the Stone Age of North America*. Annual Report, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D. C.

- Hieb, Louis A. (1972) Meaning and mismeaning: Toward an understanding of the ritual clown. In: Alfonso Ortiz (ed.) *New Perspectives on the Pueblos*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 163-195.
- Hollingsworth, Thomas (1891) A Basque superstition. *Folklore* II: 132-133.
- Howell, Signe (1996) Nature in culture or culture in nature? Chewong ideas of 'humans' and other species. In: Philippe Descola and Gisli Pálsson (eds.) *Nature and Society: Anthropological Perspectives*. London/New York: Routledge, 127-144.
- Hutton, Christopher M. (1999) *Linguistics and the Third Reich: Mother-Tongue Fascism, Race and the Science of Language*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Ingold, Tim (2004) Beyond biology and culture: The meaning of evolution in a relational world. *Social Anthropology* 12: 209-221.
- Ivanov, Vjacheslav and Toporov, Vladimir (1965) *Slavjanske jazykovye modelirujushchie semioticheskie sistemy* [*Semiotic Modelling Systems of the Slavic Languages*]. Moscow.
- Kempe, Alfred Bray (1890) On the relation between the logical theory of classes and the geometrical theory of points. *Proceedings of the London Mathematical Society*, 1(21): 147-182.
- Kimmel, Michael (2002) Metaphor, imagery, and culture: Spatialized ontologies, mental tools, and multimedia in the making. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Vienna. Available online: <http://sammelpunkt.philo.at:8080/archive/00000006/01/zentralpdf.PDF> [11.29.06]
- Koerner, E. F. K. (2000) Linguistics and ideology in the study of language. In: René Dirven, Bruce Hawkins and Esra Sandikcioglu (eds.) *Language and Ideology. Vol. 1. Cognitive Theoretical Approaches*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 253-276.
- Lakoff, George and Johnson, Mark (1980) *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Lakoff, George and Turner, Mark (1989) *More than Cool Reason: A Field Guide to Poetic Metaphor*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press.
- Langacker, Ronald W. (1997) The contextual basis of cognitive semantics. In: Jan Nuyts and Eric Pederson (eds.) *Language and Conceptualisation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 229-252.
- Lebeuf, Arnold (1987) Des Éveques et des Ourses. Études de quelques Chapiteaux du Cloître de Saint Lizier en Couserans. *Ethnologia Polona* 13: 257-280.
- Levinson, Stephen (1996) Relativity in spatial conception and description. In: John J. Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson (eds.) *Rethinking Linguistic Relativity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 37-69.
- Lovejoy, Arthur O. (1960) [1936] *The Great Chain of Being: The Study in the History of an Idea*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Lucy, John A. (1996a) *Grammatical Categories and Cognition: A Case Study of the Linguistic Relativity Hypothesis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lucy, John A. (1996b) The scope of linguistic relativity: An analysis and review of empirical research. In: John J. Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson (eds.) *Rethinking Linguistic Relativity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 177-202.

- Lucy, John A. (1997) The linguistics of 'colour'. In: C. L. Hardin and Luisa Maffi (eds.) *Colour Categories in Thought and Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 320-346.
- MacIntyre, Alasdair (1984) *After Virtue*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- McClellan, Catherine (1970) *The Girl who Married the Bear: A Masterpiece of Indian Oral Tradition*. Publications on Ethnology, No. 2. Ottawa: Museum of Man.
- Merchant, Carolyn (1980) *The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology and the Scientific Revolution*. San Francisco: Harper Collins.
- Molina González, A. and Vélez Pérez, A. (1986) L'ours dans les fêtes et carnivals d'hiver. In: Claude Dendaltheche (ed.), *L'Ours Brun: Pyrénées, Agruzzes, Mts. Cantabriques, Alpes du Trentin*, 135-146. Pau: Acta Biologica Montana.
- Morgan, Pamela S. (1997) Self-presentation in a speech of Newt Gingrich. *Pragmatics* 7(3): 275-308.
- Morgan, Pamela S. (1998) *Beyond the Issues: A Linguistic and Conceptual Study of American Public Discourse*. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation. University of California, Berkeley.
- Müller, F. Max (1888) *Bibliographies of Words and the Home of the Aryas*. London: Longmans, Green & Co.
- Murphy, Patrick D. (1994) Voicing Another Nature. In: Karen Hohne and Helen Wussow (eds.) *A Dialogue of Voices: Feminist Literary Theory and Bakhtin*. Minneapolis/London: University of Minnesota Press, 59-82.
- Ngũgĩ wa Thiong'o (1986) *Decolonising the Mind: The Politics of Language in African Literature*. Heinemann: London.
- Olds, Linda (1992) Integrating ontological metaphors: Hierarchy and interrelatedness. *Soundings: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 75(2-3): 403-420.
- Palmer, Gary B. (1996) *Toward a Theory of Cultural Linguistics*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Palmer, Gary B. (2006) When does cognitive linguistics become cultural? Case studies in Tagalog voice and Shona noun classifiers. In: June Luchjenbroers (ed.) *Cognitive Linguistics Investigations: Across Languages, Fields and Philosophical Boundaries*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 13-43.
- Patent, Jason (forthcoming) Cultural models in the U.S. and China: A linguistic investigation of distributed cognition. To appear in the conference volume for the 8th Conference on Conceptual Structure, Discourse & Language: Language in Action. U. C. San Diego, November 3-5, 2006.
- Peillen, Txomin (1986) Le culte de l'ours chez les anciens Basques. In: Claude Dendaltheche (ed.) *L'Homme et la Nature dans les Pyrénées*. Paris: Berger Levrault, 171-173.
- Pepper, Stephen C. (1942) *The Great Hypotheses*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Perurena, Patziku (1992) *Koloreak Euskal Usarioan*. Tolosa: Erein.
- Perurena, Patziku (1993) *Euskaran Sorgindutako Numeroak*. Donostia/San Sebastián: Kutxa Fundazio Sozial eta Kulturala.

- Pócs, E. (1989) Hungarian *táltos* and his European parallels. In: Mihály Hoppál and Juha Pentikäinen (eds.) *Uralic Mythology and Folklore*. Budapest: Ethnographic Institute of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences/Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society, 251-276.
- Poliakov, Léon (1974) *The Aryan Myth: A History of Racist and Nationalist Ideas in Europe*. New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers.
- Praneuf, Michel (1989) *L'ours et les Hommes dans les Traditions européennes*. Paris: Editions Imago.
- Rockwell, David (1991) *Giving Voice to Bear: North American Indian Myths, Rituals and Images of the Bear*. Niwot, CO: Roberts Rinehart Publishers.
- Sacaze, Julien (1982) *Inscriptions antiques des Pyrénées*. Toulouse.
- Sandikcioglu, Esra (2000) Orientalism: The otherness of the Orient: Politico-cultural implications of ideological categorisations In: René Dirven, Roslyn M. Frank and Cornelia Ilie (eds.) *Language and Ideology. Vol. 2. Cognitive Descriptive Approaches*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 161-188.
- Sarrionandia, Joseba (1985) *Ni ez Naiz Hemengoa*. Iruña: Pamiela.
- Sarrionandia, Joseba (1988) *Marginalia*. Donostia: Elkar.
- Schattenmann, Marc (forthcoming) The deep structure of globalisation: An essay on Habermas's theory of modernity and the logic of the New World Order. Discussion Paper Series of the Faculty of Law, Economics and Social Sciences, University of Erfurt. Available at:
<http://www.innovationsoekonomie.de/discussion-paper/discussion.html>.
- Sharifian, Farzad (2003) On cultural conceptualisations. *Journal of Cognition and Culture* 3: 187-207.
- Sharifian, Farzad (forthcoming) Distributed, emergent cultural cognition, conceptualization, and language. In: Roslyn M. Frank, René Dirven, Tom Ziemke and Enrique Bernárdez (eds.) *Body, Language and Mind. Vol. II. Sociocultural Situatedness*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Shepard, Paul (1992) Post-historic primitivism. In: Max Oelshlaeger (ed.) *The Wilderness Condition: Essays on Environment and Civilisation*. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 40-89.
- Shepard, Paul and Sanders, Barry (1992) *The Sacred Paw: the Bear in Nature, Myth and Literature*. New York: Arkana Press.
- Shils, Edward (1981) *Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Shore, Bradd (1996) *Culture in Mind: Cognition, Culture and the Problem of Meaning*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Smith, Brewster M. (1985) The metaphorical basis of selfhood. In: George De Vos, Anthony Marsella and Frances L. K. Hsu (eds.) *Culture and Self: Asian and Western Perspectives*. New York/London: Tavistock Publications, 56-88.
- Snyder, Gary (1990) *The Practice of the Wild*. San Francisco: North Point.
- Snyder, Gary (1995) Re-inhabitation. In: Alan Drengson and Yuichi Inoue (eds.) *The Deep Ecology Movement: An Introductory Anthology*. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 67-73.

- Speck, Frank C. (1945) *The Celestial Bear Comes Down to Earth: the Bear Ceremony of the Munsee-Mahican in Canada as Related by Nekatcit*. In collaboration with Jesse Moses, Delaware Nation, Ohsweken, Ontario. Reading, PA: Reading Public Museum and Art Gallery.
- Taylor, Charles (1989) *Sources of the Self. The Making of Modern Identity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Time Life, Editors (1992) *The Spirit Life*. Alexandria, VA: Time-Life Books.
- Titiev, Mischa (1942) Notes on Hopi witchcraft. *Papers of the Michigan Academy of Science, Arts and Letters*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 28: 549-557.
- Theweleit, Klaus (1977-78) *Männerphantasien*. Frankfurt am Main: Verlag Roter Stern.
- Theweleit, Klaus (1987) *Male Fantasies. Volume 1. Women, Floods, History*. Trans. Stephen Conway. In collaboration with Erica Carter and Chris Turner. Foreword by Barbara Ehrenreich. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Theweleit, Klaus (1988) *Male fantasies. Volume 2. Male Bodies: Psychologizing the White Terror*. Translation: Stephen Conway. In collaboration with Erica Carter and Chris Turner. Foreword by Jessica Benjamin and Anson Rabinbach with bibliographies and indexes.
- Truffaut, Thierry (1988) Apports des carnivals ruraux en Pays Basque pour l'étude de la mythologie: le cas du 'Basa-Jaun'. *Eusko-Ikaskuntza. Cuadernos de Sección. Antropología-Etnografía* 6: 71-81.
- Turner, Mark (1991) *Reading Minds: the Study of English in the Age of Cognitive Science*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Turner, Victor W. (1967) *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Urbeltz, Juan Antonio (1994) *Bailar el Caos*. Pamplona/Iruña: Pamiela.
- Van Dijk, Teun A. (2002) *Discourse, Knowledge and Ideology: Reformulating Old Questions*, LAUD Series A: General and Theoretical Papers, Paper N° 546, Essen.
- van Leeuwen-Turnovcová, Jirina (1991) KRUMM und DREHEN im Kulturparadigma der ORDNUNG. *Znakolog* 3: 131-166.
- van Leeuwen-Turnovcová, Jirina (1994) TAUB, BLIND, STUMM und DUMM: Zur Semantik der Abweichung vom Gewohnten. *Zeitschrift für Slawistik* 39: 545-559.
- Vukanović, T. P. (1959) Gypsy bear-leaders in the Balkan Peninsula. *Journal of the Gypsy Lore Society* 3, XXXVII: 106-125.
- Watson, Cameron (1996) Folklore and Basque nationalism: language, myth, reality. *ASEN: Nations and Nationalism* 2 (1): 7-34.
- Watson, Helen (1990) The Social foundations of mathematics. Natural number in culturally diverse forms of life. *Social Studies of Science* 20, 2 (May): 283-312.
- Whorf, Benjamin L. (1956) *Thought and Reality: Selected Writings of Benjamin Lee Whorf*. John B. Carroll (ed.) Cambridge: M.I.T Press.
- Whorf, Benjamin L. and Trager, George L. (1996) The 'Yale Report'. Report on linguistics research in the Department of Anthropology of Yale University for the term Sept. 1937-June 1938. In: Penny Lee, *The Whorf Theory Complex*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 251-280.
- Zaldua Etxabe, Luis Mari (1996) *Saroeak Urnietan/Seles en Urnieta/Stone Octagons in Urnieta*. Urnieta Kulturnieta, S. A. [cf. <http://www.paisvasco.com/urnieta>].

Zaldua Etxabe, Luis Mari (2006) Saroiak eta Kortak: Mendialdeko Antzinako Gizartearen Oinordeak. Urnieta.

Roslyn M. Frank
University of Iowa